NDEXED GOVERNMENT OF INDIA

File No. 10/21/CF-68

Ministry of CABINET SECRETARIAT

DECLASSIFIED

Department of Cabinet Affairs

Cabinet SECTION

NOTES/ CONCECCONOCIONAX

Subject

Indexed on 21-4-1970

Fresh inquiry into the alleged death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose - Request from Members of Parliament.

C. No. 20155

Record Z. Destroy in.....

Norto be netted in Sectional Note Book 

Initials of Clerk ...

CABINET

Previous References

Stiched by

Check d by

RECORDED-B

Note | 1- 15 Corsp. | 2 | 1- 88.

Datta

OF INDIA

Later References

10/19/56

F. 6/1/6/74-CF Kee राष्ट्रीय अभिलेखागार NATIONAL ARCHIVES

8, 97 (Unbläsched). MGIPTC\_317-19 General/69-69-GIPTC-(2-361)-12-9-28-2,000,000.

SECRET F. no. 10/21/CF/1968

### CABINET SECRETARIAT

The President mentioned to me when I called on him on the 7th March 1968, about the request of Members of Parliament for a fresh inquiry into the alleged death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose. I am submitting a note to the Home Minister separately; in the mean time I submit a copy of the minutes of the meeting of Secretaries held on the 17th February 1968 which discussed the various requests in the memorandum of Members of Parliament.

(D.S. Joshi) Cabinet Secretary 11.3.1968

1319-05/68

(Copy placed below for

reference)

ple 1-11/cox

President

266/20/68

ysic)

Pr. 18

GILLOSIELU

When I called on the President on the 7th March 1968, he referred to the representations addressed to him by Members of Parliament regarding Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose and in particular their request for a fresh inquiry into fact and the circumstances of his death. Some Members had met him ( without explaining first what their purpose was) and raised this issue personally. I told the President that a group of Secretaries had met to consider the memorandum from Kembers of Parliament and suggested certain courses of action. The President desired that the Home Minister may apply his mind afresh to the demand for a frosh inquiry into the alleged death of Netail Subhash Chandra Bose. Home Minister may. therefore, kindly see. In the mean time, I am submitting to the President a copy of the minutes of the meeting of Secretaries held on the 17th February 1968.

Home Minister

Copy to Home Secretary for information.

415 DSIE 14

May I see the lite at ! it?

John sie seen thes.

3. No.3(R) p.6-7/cor.

Memorandum dt. 7-3-69 from Members of Parliament to P.M.

This is going to be unavoidable.

Sd: Indira Gandhi

Pp.

Sd: B. Sivaraman 13-8-69

L'had

In this connection, notes on p.1-2/n ante may kindly be seen. The Secretaries Committee discussed the various requests contained in the memorandum, submitted earlier, by the Members of Parliament. The minutes of the meeting (Item No.9) held on 17th February 1968, circulated by the Ministry of Home Affairs, may kindly be seen on p.3-4/cor.

From the minutes of the meeting held in February 1968, it seems that the Ministry of External Affairs is concerned with the question of enquiring into the alleged death of Hetaji Subhas Chandra Bose. This was also confirmed by Shri L.D. Hindi, Under Secretary in the Ministry of Home Affairs, to whom I contacted in the matter. We may accordingly ask the Ministry of External Affairs to let us have a self-contained note urgently for Cabine t Secretary's information.

(South East Asla) in the Ministry of External Affairs, is blaced below for consideration.

whanted

ill sund the note by towarm. 12/16 while

12/16 aprile 22/8

\$1.110.5 (R) p.9/ar D.O.No.C/551/10/69/JP dated the 23rd August 1969, from the Ministry of External Affairs.

Ple se put up on 25/8 without fail.

Sd: J.S. Pongia

11(0)

In addition to submitting a Memo. to P.L.,

Shi Samar Guha, M.P., has also given a Notice of a
Resolution on the subject of instituting an inquiry into
the alleged of the Si Netaji Sibhas Chandra Bose. The
Resolution is coming up/in the Lok Sabha on the 29th
Au 1. t, 1959. In case, the Resolution is him por discussion
in the House, the stand of the Government on the demand
for setting up of judicial inquiry will be made known. We
may accordingly await till 29th before submitting the case
to P.L.

I for discussion

35/00

Attention is specially is viled to para 6 of the note evelored with FR In The FR it is stated that the Iveign Ministr is going lo take a decision on the Gort stand in respect of a non-official resolution in Parliament on the setting up of a Commission of Inquiry in complete late Netaji's death. Incidentally, et is the Cabrinet CHER on Part. Affairs which decides the Govt stand on various resolutions in Parliament. I have checked from Shiri Mangir Singh -Min grat. Affairs are preparing a note for consideration of the Cat.
Chee on Parl Affairs. Ohe weekings
one wonally held on wednesdays.) important cases The Cab. Cofee in

Luglia

-6-Part. Affairs seeks The decision of the Cabinet, if it feels that the decision grew Cabinet is necessary: to which for the decision of the CCRA. ze: The Govt stand on the revolution. Thereafter as may like to ask the Foreign Fecretary to bring a paper for Consideration of the Secretaries Her in Internal Affaires. L'alis course is Enggestes because the Subject is being dealt with in the Min y External Affaires.) 4. A copy of PM's ruin whe on 5 No 3 will also be sent to Min of Ext Affairs. The margin PAGa pulan out p 6 com-25 8 68 Je(e) The letter at seriae 3 was briefly referred to at mic last datinet meeting and it had been agreed at CS's suggestion that decision should gend till papers bearing on the stand baken in the past have been seen. The enclosure to PR is relovant in Mis context. Laner & the Cabinet Committee on PPE by EA ministry pursuance to suri Gunds resolution which is due to be discussed in Parliament in the 29 in no consideration dry Mi.  Note for the Cabinet Committee on Parliamentary Affairs - Private Member's Resolution on 29.8.69.

Subject:- Disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945.

Cabinet Secretary informed me that Prime Minister has desired that t is note (placed below) from the Ministry of Home Affairs may be brought up for consideration of the Cabinet in the next meeting. It need not be placed before the Cabinet Committee on Parliamentary Affairs. Please issue d.o. letter below to Shri G.K. Arora, Deputy Secretary, Home, with copy to Shri H.N. Trivedi, Secretary, Department of Parliamentary Affairs. I have already spoken to Shri Arora and informed 🗪 🥌 of this position.

After issue of the letters, JS(C) may also kindly see.

29.8.1969

US(C)

I have spoken to shir like Arosa, Deputy Secy MIHA He Stated that the water for the capital would be sent to us either today or on renday, mi 1st September 1969,

Is (c) may brindly see.

30/8 30/8 15(0)

No. 6(9) Letter dt. 29/8/9 & Dy. Sey,

meeting: two 4 in

Pl. include this

in The List

of items for 11 munt

Cabruet

S. No.7(R) p.28-37/cor. Memo. No.32/132/69-Poll.1(A) at. 1st September 1969, from the Ministry of Home Affairs. 'FR'

F/'H'

In this connection, notes on prepage and S. No.6 may kindly be seen. The Ministry of Home Affairs have sent May kindly be seen. The Ministry of Home Affairs have sent 45 copies of a Note regarding "Disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945" for the consideration of the Cabinet. The Note is in order from the procedural points of view and may kindly be approved for circulation to the Members of the Cabinet and its inclusion in the agenca for the Cabinet meeting fixed for September 5, 1969. He has already approved the inclusion of this paper in the agenda for the Cabinet meeting on 5th September.

A draft press brief has not been sent by the MHA. They may be requested to do so, if necessary. Dr A.

removed for ISSNe

V.N. 8( 95mm)

Mom . olt. 2/9/19 6.

mino . dt. 2/9/696 S.No. 9 ( Ismy numbers of al.

S.No. 10 ( Issue) Intime time to stey

Minn. No. 32/132/19-16.1(A) dl: 3/9/19 for m 41.

Minter y Cal muling 5. No. 12 ( ) SSW) held in 5/9/15. \$45-49

cah

to them. However, if there is consistent demand, we may consider having the matter informally examined by a competent and impartial person."

Copies of the representation received from Members of Parliament, decision of the Cabinet and PM's alminute were sent to Ministry of Home Affairs for taking further action in the matter vide JS's D.O. letter dated 11th September 1969 to Shri T.C.A. Srinivasavaradan, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs.

It is understood from S.A. to Home Minister that the matter was discussed yesterday by the Home Minister with Home Secretary and other officers in the Ministry and it has been decided to call a meeting of the Members of Parliament, who have signed the representation in order to explain to them the view point of the Government. It is accordingly suggested that a copy of the representation now received from Shri Mulka Govinda Reddy may also be passed on to the Ministry of Home Affairs, so that the Member could also be invited to the said meeting. The position may also be explained to PM's Secretariat.

Two drafts letters are accordingly put up for consideration.

alini

p.58/c

SINO 15 (I) U. o. M. 10/21/4 68 St 12-11 to PH's Seell

SI-M. 16 (I) Letter st. 17-1069 to 35 pp56-53/c M/s H P

J. No. 13 M. 50-54cm.

S. no 14 ph. 55-50/ca

Re

Reference S1.No.16 and hotes at pp.10-11/ante.

We had requested the Ministry of Home Affairs to let us know about the action taken in this case vide para 2 of JS's letter at S1.No.16. No reply has been received. We may remined the Ministry.DFA.

It is seen from news haders repositionally that from Ministr has repositionally the Signatures to the invited the Signatures to the invited the Signatures to the Acet meeting as a section from JM. Section as to a section from JM. Section from JM

It has been checked up from the R. Kuffpuras, Under Secretary, H/o HA. That all the 43 Mbs who had made a demand for enquiry and Shi Mulka Govinda Reddy have been wirled to allered the meeting called by the Home Hairs his on 20th November 1969. I He is sending a Note in writing to confirm this.

I Another MP. Shi 8.8. Swell whom name was missed in Carlin is also heing inviled.

Si 110 by les

Muchi 574/64

Cal

S. No. 20(R)

Office Memo. No.29/48/69-Poll.II. dated 18-2-70 from the Ministry of Home Affairs.

P.64-75/cor.

45 copies of a Note regarding "Fresh Inquiry into disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945 - Demand for" have been received from the Ministry of Home Affairs for the consideration of the abinet. The Note is in order from the procedural points of view and may kindly be approved for circulation to the Members of the Cabinet for discussion.

As the Parliament Session has commenced, press brief would not be necessary.

p76-79/cm

S.N.21(2) Agends for Cel

Novel ) Intima to tay

p8182

J. No. 24(2)

Him M. 5/3/2 - change of term /

1838 Mintergent.

1838 meeting held
on 4/3/2.

-15-Action on They git is imple to. It file may be now shed pl. 17/4/70 Splyple 17.4.70.

CCRRESPONDENCE

No.19/50/68-Pub.II Government of India MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

> New Delhi, dated the 7th March, 1968 17th Phalguna, 1889 S.E.

#### OFFICE MEMORANDUM

Subject: - Memorandum from Members of Parliament suggesting steps to be taken to accord honour and recognition to the personality of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose. . . . . . . .

The undersigned is directed to refer to this Ministry's Office Memorandum No.19/50/68-Pub.II, dated the 16th February, 1968, on the subject noted above, and to send herewith a copy of the minutes of the Meeting held in the room of the Cabinet Secretary on the 17th February, 1968.

(L. D. HINDI) 7/3/18
UNDER SECRETARY.

To

(1) Cabinet Secretary (Shri D.S. Joshi)
(2) Defence Secretary (Shri V. Shankar)

(3) Education Secretary (Shri P.N. Kirpal) (4) Secretary, I. & B. (Shri A. Mitra) (5) Secretary, Min. of External Affairs (Shri T.N. Kaul)

(6) Secretary, Deptt. of Parliamentary Affairs (Shri H. N. Trivedi)

(7) Secretary, Min. of W.H. & S.

(Shri B. R. Patel) (8) Joint Secretary (Political, Min. of Home Affairs (Shri T.C.A. Srinivasavardan)

Copy to P.S. to Home Secretary P.A. to J.S.(PR) Public I Section.

-2-

#### PRESENT

- 1. Shri D.S. Joshi, Cabinet Secretary.
- 2. Shri V. Shankar, Defence Secretary.

3. Shri L.P. Singh, Home Secretary
4. Shri Asoka Mitra, Secretary, Information and Broadcasting.

5. Shri T.N. Kaul, Secretary, External Affairs.

- 6. Shri B. R. Patel, Secretary, Department of Works and Housing.
- 7. Shri G.K. Chandiramani, Additional Secretary, Education.
- 8. Shri H.N. Trivedi, Secretary, Parliamentary Affairs.
  9. Shri K.R. Prabhu, Joint Secretary, Home Affairs.
  10. Shri Manjit Singh, Director (South East Asia), Ministry of External Affairs.
- 2. The suggestions made in the Memorandum submitted by the Members of Parliament to accord honour and recognition to the personality of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose were considered and the following decisions were taken:-
  - (1) Placing of a portrait in the Central Hall of Parliament and offices of the Government.

There is a Committee of Parliament under the Chairmanship of the Speaker, to deal with the question of placing portraits of national leaders in the Central Hall. The Department of Parliamentary Affairs will bring the suggestion to the notice of this Committee.

No directions have been issued to Government offices making it obligatory to display photographs or portraits of national leaders in the offices. There is, however, no bar to photographs or portraits being placed in offices but care has to be taken to ensure that no controversy arose due to display of any photograph or portrait. The same practice could be followed in the matter of placing portraits of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose in offices and no directions in the matter could be necessary.

(Action: Department of Parliamentary Affairs) Ministry of Home Affairs.

### (2) Erection of statue in New Delhi.

It was considered desirable to erect a statue of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose at a prominent place in New Delhi. However, in the matter of erection of statues and memorials, Government's policy had been to extend cooperation to non-official organisations and not to erect the statues or memorials on their own. The same procedure could be followed in this case also and if any organisation came forward to put up the statue, Government could extend necessary cooperation to this organisation by providing a suitable site.

(Action: Ministry of Works, Housing and Supply)

### (3) Recognition of military genius.

The Defence Secretary stated that no assessment of military genius of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose had been made. The general view was that his role in organising the Indian National Army was more of a political nature than of an Army General and this role would find a place in the history of the INA campaigns.

(Action: Ministry of Defence)

### (4) Observance of birthday.

It was agreed that this was essentially a matter for non-official organisations and that it would not be possible to treat the birthday of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose as a national holiday. The only National Birthday being observed is that of Mahatama Gandhi.

(Action: Min. of Home Affairs)

### (5) Erection of memorials at Kohima and Imphal in the honour of IMA heroes

It was observed that following the general policy in the matter of erection of memorials Government could not themselves erect any memorial for the INA heroes but could give assistance to non-official agencies. As there was already a proposal for putting up a memorial at Moirang in Manipur, Education Ministry would consider it and see what assistance could be given to the sponsors of this project.

(Action: Ministry of Education)

(6) Publication of the volume on I.N.A.

The Defence Ministry will consider this suggestion.

(Action: Ministry of Defence)

(7) Giving due place to Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose in the History of Freedom Movement.

Two volumes of the History of Freedom Movement covering the period upto 1907 have already been published. The third volume which would cover the period during which Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose participated in the freedom movement is under preparation. Dr. Tara Chand is engaged on this work and is assisted by a Committee of Consultants who could be expected to take due note of the role of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose in the freedom movement. It was decided that the suggestion made by the Members of Parliament should be brought to the notice of Dr. Tara Chand by the Ministry of Education.

(Action: Ministry of Education)

(8) Publication of Netaji's writings and speeches.

It was decided that these writings and speeches would be brought together by the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting and published after suitably editing them.

(Action: Ministry of Information and Broadcasting)

(9) Demand for fresh inquiry into the alleged death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.

It was explained that after the inquiry made by the Shah Nawaz Committee, no fresh material had come to notice. Demand for a fresh inquiry had been made from time to time and in reply to questions in Parliament Government had been taking the stand that, according to all available information, Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose had died and that there was no need for a further inquiry. It was decided that no change was called for in this stand.

(Action: Ministry of External Affairs)

......

No. F. 18-3/68/CAI(2) Government of India. Ministry of Education, New Delhi, 1º May, 1968 Vaisakha, 1890(3) OFFICE LEMORANDUM ject: - Memorandum from Members of Parliament suggesting steps to be taken to accord honour and recognition to the personality of Netaji Sublash Chandra Bose. The undersigned is directed to refer to Ministry of Mome Affairs Office memorandum No. 19/50/68-Pub.II, dated the 7th March, 1968, on the subject mentioned above and to state that in so far as action on the decision contained in para 2(7) of the minutes of the meeting held in the room of the Cabinet Secretary, is concerned, it may be stated that Dr. Tara Chand who is writing the History of Preedom Lovement and who was informed of the views contained n the Memorandum submitted by more than 300 M.Ps about according due honour and recognition to the personality of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose and his historic role in freedom struggle, has replied that no history of the freedom movement of India during the 20th century can ignore the part played by Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose in the freedom struggle. His ideas and his contribution to the freedom struggle will find a place in the Third Volume of the History of Freedom wovement to be published by the Government of India. (P. Gangulee) Deputy Secretary to the Govt. of India The Cabinet Secret riat. The Ministry of Home Affairs, (Shri K.R. Prabhu, Jt. Secretary)

MEMBER OF PARLIAMENT

(LOK SABHA)

MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT (LOK SABHA)

Smt. Indira Gandhi, Prime Minister of India, NEW DELHI.

PARLIAMENT HOUSE. NEW DELHI - 1. August 7, 1969.

Dear Madam.

You will, we hope, remember that over 350 Members of Parliament made an earnest appeal to the Government to institute a fresh enquiry into the circumstances leading to disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. Nearly 100 other Members of Parliament extended their oral support to the appeal as they were not present in Delhi at the time of submission of the Memorandum to the Government.

NEW DE

After a lapse of 20 years the Government of India very rightly considered it desirable to order for a fresh probe into the background of the murder of Mahatma Gandhi.

Recently the Government of India sympathetically agreed to a request made by a number of Parliament Members to institute a judicial enquiry into the cause of tragic death of the Jan Sangh leader, Shri Dindayal Upadhyay.

We trust that in a similar patriotic spirit you will accept the appeal made to the Government by an overwhelming majority (nearly two-third majority) of the Members of Parliament to set up a fresh Enquiry Commission, consisting of retired Supreme Court Judges and eminent publicmen, to make fresh probe into the circumstances leading to disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose.

We fervently hope that the demand for a fresh enquiry about Netaji voiced by millions of our countrymen will not fail to evoke patriotic response from you. Let us not forget that a national duty to fulfil regarding Netaji is overdue.

Jai Hind!

15. P. Venkatasubhaiah

16. Madhu Limaye

17. Rabi Ray

18. Bal Raj Madhok.

19. A.B. Vajpayee

20. S.M. Joshi

21. N.C.Chatterjee

22. Humayun Kabir

23. Ila Pal Chaudhuri

24. Samar Guha

25. Tenneti Viswanathan

26. Mrityunjay Prasad

27. D.S.Raju

28. Susheela Rohatgi

29. S.C. Samanta 30. N.K.P.Salve

31. Tridib Chaudhuri

32. Bedabrata Barua

33. Era Seshiyan

34. Bakar Ali Mirza

35. G.M. Bakshi

36. M.M.Patel

37. Sharda Mukerji

38. J.K.Choudhury

39. B.K. Daschowdhury

40. J.Chanda

41. C.C. Desai

42. K. L. Gupta

43. G.G.Swell

44. P.V.Shastri

Yours sincerely,

Sd/-

1. N.G.Ranga.

2. D.K.Kunte

3. Shashi Bhushan

4. A.K. Chanda

5. A.K.Sen

6. K.N. Tewari

7. A.S. Saigal

8. T.S. Jadhav

9. S.N. Dwivedy

10. Nath Pai

11. V.Sambasivam

12. K.Ambazhagan

13. Karni Singh

14. B.P. Mandal

(True copy nept-page)

MEMBER OF PARLIAMENT PARLIAMENT HOUSE, NEW DELHI- 1. OK SABHA) August 7, 1969. Smt. Indira Gandhi, Prime Minister of India, NEW DELHI. Dear Madam. You will, we hope, remember that over 350 Members of Parliament made earnest appeal to the Government to institute a fresh enquiry into the circumstances leading to disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. Nearly 100 other Members of Parliament extended their oral support to the appeal as they were not present in Delhi at the time of submission of the Memorandum to the Government. After a lapse of 20 years the Government of India very rightly considered it desirable to order for a fresh probe into the background of the murder of Mahatma Gandhi. Recently, the Government of India sympathetically agreed to a request made by a number of Parliament Members to institute a judicial enquiry into the cause of tragic death of the Jan Sangh leader, Shri Dindayal Upadhaye. We trust that in a similar patriotic spirit you ming majority (nearly two-third majority) of the Members of will accept the appeal made to the Government by an overwhel-Parliament to set up a fresh Enquiry Commission, consisting of retired Supreme Court Judges and eminent publicmen, to make fresh probe into the circumstances leading to disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. We fervently hope that the demand for a fresh enquiry about Netaji voiced by millions of our countrymen will not fail to evoke patriotic response from you. Let us not forget that a national duty to fulfil regarding Netaji is over due. Jai Hind! Yours sincerely

Will you kindly refer to your letter

P.P. Caprihan. Deputy Secretary.

19th August, 1969.

My dear Manjit,

C.M. No. 19/50/68-Pub.II, dated the 7th March, 1968, fordarding minutes of the meeting held in the room of the Cabinet Secretary on the 17th February, 1968, to consider the Memorandum from Members of Parliament suggesting steps to be taken to accord honour and recognition to the personality of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. With reference to the demand made by Members of Parliament for fresh inq iry into the alleged death of Netaji, it was decided that no change was called for in the stand of the Government.

2. I enclose a copy of another representation received from several Members of Parliament on the same subject, which has been for arded by Prime Minister to Cabinet Secretary for examination. Would you kindly let us have urgently a self-contained note for submission to Cabinet Secretary?

With kind regards,

It cal South of Takestude prison in Siberia has not been ber

Yours sincerely.

U (P.P. Caprihan)

Shri Manjit Singh,
Director (South East Asia),
Ministry of External Affairs,
New Delhi,

20/8/69.

MOST IMMEDIATE/By SPECIAL MESSENGER

विवेश मंत्रालय, नई विल्ली-११

MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS

New Delhi-11

August 23, 1969

Manjit Singh, DIRECTOR (EA)

No.C/551/10/69/JP

2200

4 Lok

My dear Prem,

Will you kindly refer to your letter No. 10/21/CF-69 of August 19, 1969?

2. As desired, I enclose a note which will explain the repeated demands made in Parliament for holding further enquiries into the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose. I should like to add that a Private Member's Resolution is coming up on August 29th in Right Sabha, seeking the setting up of an Enquiry Commission. The relevant papers are being put up to the Foreign Minister and a decision on the demand raised in the Resolution will be taken by him, on Monday the 25th August.

With kind regards,

Yours sincerely,

Permi put up without your without pure

Manjit Singh y

Shri P.P. Caprihan, Deputy Secretary, Cabinet Secretariat, (Deptt. of Cabinet Affars) Rashtrapati Bhavan, New Delhi.

Recd at 5.30 p. M.
Topould by me

538/69

### Official Enquiry conducted in 1956:

In response to the public demand that all the facts relating to the last stages of Netaji's life should be enquired into and made known, an Enquiry Committee was appointed by the Government of Indiain April, 1956. The Committee consisted of Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose (elder brother of Netaji) and Shri S.N. Maitra, Chief Commissioner of Andaman and Nicobar Islands. The report of this Committee, which was signed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan and Shri S.N. Maitra, was released for publication in September, 1956. The Government of India accepted the report. The conclusion reached by the Enquiry Committee was that Netaji met his death as a result of an air crash at Taihoku airfield in Formosa on August 18, 1945 and that his ashes are now at the Renkoji Temple in Tokyo. However, the third member, namely, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, did not sign the report. Later on, he submitted a separate report dissenting from the findings of the majority report. After laying a copy of this report on the table of the House on 11.9.1956, the late Prime Minister, Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, made a statement in the Lok Sabha in which he said inter alia that Government felt that the evidence adduced in the report was practically overwhelming and should be accepted.

## Government's attitude to repeated requests for further probes:

2. There have been repeated requests and demands on several occasions for undertaking another enquiry. However, Government having accepted the findings of the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee have taken the view that unless fresh evidence or new facts were brought to light, another enquiry was unwarranted. In the Rajya Sahha itself in 1966, in answer to Starred Question No.284 on 17.5.1966, and again in reply to Unstarred Question No.265 on 2.8.1966, the Government reiterated this viewpoint. Assertions that Swami Shardanand of the Sholmari Ashram was, in fact, Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose, had been denied by the Swami himself. Another claim made by Dr. S.N. Sinha that Netaji was incarcerated in cell No.46 of Yakutusk prison in Siberia has not been corroborated by any tangible evidence. Recently, Lt.—General Fujiwara of Japan, who came to India to present Netaji's sword, requested

reply to the question, the Prime Minister had stated: "Since no new facts have been brought to light, Government do not consider that any fresh enquiry is warranted".

that pld the facts

### Recent requests for a Judicial Enquiry:

6. Shri Samar Guha Wrote in May this year to the Prime Minister requesting for a judicial enquiry on the analogy of the enquiry being conducted in regard to Gandhiji's assassiation 20 years after Mahatmaji's death. The Foreign Minister in reply to this letter informed Shri Guha that the terms of reference of the enquiry being conducted into Mahatma Gandhi's assassimation did not seek to establish Gandhiji's death. In the letter sent to the Prime Minister by 44 M.Ps, dated August 7, the request for the appointment of a fresh enquiry Commission, consisting of retired Supreme Court judges and eminent public men, has been made on the ground that a fresh probe was being conducted in regard to the assassination of Mahatma Gandhi and that a judicial enquiry was also being conceded in response to a number of M.Ps' request into the cause of death of the Jan Sangh Leader Shri Dindayal Upadhyay. It is quite obvious that these two examples that have been cited are not on all fours with the demand for an enquiry to establish the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.

the evidence address in the report was practically overwhole or end should be assepted.

In There have been repeated requests and denunts on several pecutions for undertaking another enquiry. Hewever, deverment having accepted the findings of the Shah Nevez Elen Constitue have telen the view that unless from evidence or new facts were

brought to light, another enquiry was nevertable. In the .

Major Sabba Stroll in 1900, in onever to Starred Quanties to .000 on 17.8.1805, and scain in reply to Unstarred Question No.200 on S.S.1806, the Gorarment religioned this viewpoint. Assertion

this Sweet Sherdanand of the Shelpari Ambres was, in foot, Height Subhash Chardre Seso, had been desired by the Sound bisser: Another plain made by Dr. S.N. Siehe that Height was threstorated

in call Brass of Tokutouk prices in Siborio has not been corpo-

of Joseph, who came to inite in process Valuation sword, when

that the matter should be investigated "one; and for all'all

### Official Enquiry conducted in 1956:

In response to the public demand that all the facts relating to the last stages of Netaji's life should be enquired into and mads known, an Enquiry Committee was appointed by the Government of Indiain April, 1956. The Committee consisted of Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose (elder brother of Netaji) and Shri S.N. Maitra, Chief Commissioner of Andaman and Nicobar Islands. The report of this Committee, which was signed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan and Shri S.N. Maitra, was released for publication in September, 1956. The Government of India accepted the report. The conclusion reached by the Enquiry Committee was that Netaji met his death as a result of an air crash at Taihoku airfield in Formosa on August 18, 1945 and that his ashes are now at the Renkoji Temple in Tokyo. However, the third member, namely, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, did not sign the report. Later on, he submitted a separate report dissenting from the findings of the majority report. After laying a copy of this report on the table of the House on 11.9.1956, the late Prime Minister. Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, made a statement in the Lok Sabha in which he said inter alia that Government felt that the evidence edduced in the report was practically overwhelming and should be accepted.

# Government's attitude to repeated requests for further probes:

There have been repeated requests and demands on several occasions for undertaking another enquiry. However, Government having accepted the findings of the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee have taken the view that unless fresh evidence or new facts were brought to light, another enquiry was unwarranted. In the Rajya Sahha itself in 1966, in answer to Starred Question No.284 on 17.5.1966, and again in reply to Unstarred Question No.265 on 2.8.1966, the Government reiterated this viewpoint. Assertions that Swami Shardanand of the Sholmari Ashram was, in fact, Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose, had been denied by the Swami himself. Another claim made by Dr. S.N. Sinha that Netaji was incarcerated in cell No.46 of Yakutusk prison in Siberia has not been corroborated by any tangible evidence. Recently, Lt.-General Fujiwara of Japan, who came to India to present Netaji's sword, requested

- 14-

that the matter should be investigated "once and for all". The General, however, has not produced any evidence which would warrant any further enquiry. The memorandum too refers to press reports of hearsay evidence published in 1945 and early 1956. These hearsay reports cannot warrant a fresh enquiry. It would be relevant to mention that Prime Minister, Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, had in a letter to Shri Suresh Chandra Bose on May 13, 1962 said: "I cannot send you any precise and direct proof. But all the circumstantial evidence that has been produced and which has been referred to in the Enquiry Committee's Report has convinced us of the fact that Netaji has died. In addition to this, the lapse of time now and the extreme improbability of his being alive secretly when he would be welcome in India with great joy and affection adds to that circumstantial evidence".

ruply to the quarties, the Price Minteter had seabed; "Sirve to

### Correspondence between Shri Jawaharlal Nehru and Shri Suresh Bose and Shri Amiya Bose regarding further enquiry:

- 3. A set of the letters exchanged between Prime Minister Nehru and Shri Suresh Bose or Shri Amiya Bose are enclosed.
- Minister Nehru 'agreed' with Shri Amiya Bose that something should be done to "finalise the question of Netaji's death". But he gave no assurance and there is nothing to suggest, in the context of the entire correspondence, that at any time Prime Minister Nehru had entertained doubts about the conclusive character of the evidence cited by the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee or others to establish Netaji's death. Presumably, what Shri Nehru had in mind was that something should be done to persuade those who still doubted this fact to accept the finality of the conclusion that Netaji was no more.

### Decision on the Memorandum:

5. The memorandum was discussed at a meeting of Secretaries held under the Chairmanship of the Cabinet Secretary on the 17th February, 1968, to examine the various points raised. As far as the question of a fresh enquiry was concerned, the meeting was of the view that this was not warranted as no fresh evidence had been brought to light. This recommendation was brought to the Prime Minister's notice in connection with Unstarred Question No.1408 which was answered in the Lok Sabha on 21.2.1968. In

reply to the question, the Prime Minister had stated: "Since no new facts have been brought to light, Government do not consider that any fresh enquiry is warranted".

#### Recent requests for a Judicial Enquiry:

Shri Samar Guha wrote in May this year to the Prime Minister requesting for a judicial enquiry on the analogy of the enquiry being conducted in regard to Gandhiji's assassintion 20 years after Mahatmaji's death. The Foreign Minister in reply to this letter informed Shri Guha that the terms of reference of the enquiry being conducted into Mahatma Gandhi's assassimation did not seek to establish Gandhiji's death. In the letter sent to the Prime Minister by 44 M.Ps, dated August 7, the request for the appointment of a fresh enquiry Commission, consisting of retired Supreme Court judges and eminent public men, has been made on the ground that a fresh probe was being conducted in regard to the assassination of Mahatma Gandhi and that a judicial enquiry was also being conceded in response to a number of M.Ps' request into the cause of death of the Jan Sangh Leader Shri Dindayal Upadhyay. It is quite obvious that these two examples that have been cited are not on all fours with the demand for an enquiry to establish the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.

the feather to forward to so the prior of the deaths.

The world's and to it the constant for the big willed

in the experience or o reply and with

Suresh C.Bose.

Dated 12th May, 1962.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, Prime Minister of India, New Delhi.

Dear Shri Nehru,

The report in the papers of the 8th instant is to the effect that you stated in Parliament on the previous day, in reply to a question by Shri P.C. Barooah that the majority report of the Netaji Enquiry Committee established that my brother Shri Subhas Chandra Bose, died in an air-accident.

If you hold this piece of news to be correct, it affects the members of our family more than the general public, who, however, are also deeply interested in its correctness or otherwiss.

I would, therefore, request you as his elder brother and as the seniormost surviving member of the family to forward to me the proof of his death, circumstances under which such alleged death took place.

In the expectation of a reply and with kind regards,

I remain,

Yours sincerely,

Sd/-Suresh C.Bose 12.5.62. No.704-PMH/62

May 13, 1962.

Dear Shri Suresh Bose,

I have your letter of the 12th May. You ask me to send you proof of the death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. I cannot send you any precise and direct proof. But all the circumstantial evidence that has been produced and which has been referred to in the Enquiry Committee's report has convinced us to the fact that Netaji has died. In addition to this, the lapse of time now and the extreme improbability of his being alive secretly somewhere when he would be welcomed in India with great joy and affection, adds to that circumstantial evidence.

Yours sincerely,

Sd/-Jawaharlal Nehru

Shri Suresh C.Bose, Garia, P.O.Garia, Distt. 24 Paraganas, West Bengal. SURESH C. BOSE

Garia, P.O. Garia,
Dist. 24 Parganas,
(West Bengal),
Dated 8th August, 1962.

Dear Shri Nehru,

It appears from your letter No.982-PMH/62 of the 26th June last, that your own information conveyed to you by our Ambassadors has confirmed the fact that Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose is dead.

As this piece of news, if true, vitually affects all the members of our family. I would respectfully request you to please forward to me the date, place and circumstances under which the alleged deathtook place, as reported to you.

With kind regards,

I remain,
Yours sincerely,
Suresh Chandra Bose.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, Prime Minister, New Delhi. No.1256-PMH/62

August 12, 1962

pear Shri Bose,

I have your letter of the 8th August,
I wrote to you that all the circumstantial
evidence made me believe that Netaji Subhas
Chandra Bose had died. Much of this evidence was
given in the report made by the Committee
appointed for this purpose, which visited Japan.
You will find the date, place and circumstances
mentioned in that committee's report.

Apart from that report, the length

of time that has elapsed is itself confirmatory

of the fact of his death.

Yours sincerely,

Jawaharlal Nehru.

Shri Suresh C.Bose, Garia, P.O. Garia, Dist. 24 Parganas.

A Day of the second second

1, VOODBURN PARK CALCUTTA 20

20 4.60

My dear Panditji,

With reference to our talk in Delhi recently, I would like to submit to you the following proposals foryour consideration.

The controversy regarding the aircrash at Taikoku in August 1945 is having unfortunate consequences. The report of the Enquiry Committee consisting of Shah Nawaz Khan and two other members has not found acceptance among a large section of the Indian people. The main reason for this is to be found in the fact that the Shah Nawaz Enquiry Committee did not include any person of high judicial standing and experience. Irresponsible statements by a number of persons are also keeping this controversy alive. In the national interest there should be a final judicial finding regarding the aircrash at Thaihoku in August 1945. It will be in the fitness of things if the Chief Justice of India will agree to preside over a body of Judges and enquire into this question. All the materials collected by the Shah Nawaz Enquiry Committee on the subject and other materials that may be available to the Government of India should be placed at the disposal of this body of Judges. This body should, of course, be at liberty to take any further evidence on the subject if that is considered necessary by it and if such eviden ce is available.

The Government should accept the findings of this judicial body and take whatever steps that may be found necessary on the basis of its recommendations. This being purely a national question the Government should not take into acceoumt the opinion of any individual in this matter even though he happens to be related to Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose.

I shall be thankful if you will kindly send me your message in support of the plans of Netaji Hall society.

Hope you are feeling better.

With regards,

Yours sincerely.

Sd/-Amiya Nath Bose.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, Prime Minister of India, New Pelhi. No.293-PMH/64

April 22, 1964.

My dear Amiya,

I have your letter of the 20th April,
I agree with you that something should be
done to finalise the question of Netaji's death.
But it is not quite clear to me how far it
will be proper for me to ask the Chief Justice
of India to look into this matter. It may
imvolve visiting Japan, and I am sure I cannot
ask the Chief Justice to do so.

I have sent you a brief message already about the Netaji Hall Society.

Yours sincerely,

Jawaharlal Nehru.

Shri Amiya Nath Bose, 1. Woodburn Park. Calcutta-20.

### Note for the Cabinet Committee on Parliamentary Affairs - Private Member's Resolution on August 29,1969.

Subject: Disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945.

In April 1956, in response to the public demand, Government of India appointed an Enquiry Committee to ascertain the circumstances concerning Netaji's departure from Bangkok on 16.8.1945 and his alleged death in an air-crash. The Committee consisted of the following:-

- (i) Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, M.P., Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister of Railways and Transport;
- (ii) Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, elder brother of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose; and
- (iii) Shri S.N. Maitra, I.C.S., formerly Chief Commissioner, Andamans and Nicobar.

The Committee examined witnesses in Delhi, Calcutta, Bangkok, Saigon, Tourane and Tokyo. They also examined books and articles about Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose and studied relevant classified records pertaining to the matter.

- The members compared and discussed the statements of the witnesses whom they had personally interviewed and took into consideration the evidence from several sources. The three members of the Committee then arrived at certain broad conclusions and unanimously agreed that the report should be written on the basis of these conclusions. These were summarised in a list entitled "Principal points agreed to for Draft Report dated 30.6.1956". This was signed by all the three members of the Committee on 2.7.1956.
- 3. Shri Suresh Chandra Bose had agreed with the principal conclusions and signed the documents containing these on 2.7.1956. The conclusions confirmed that Netaji had, in fact, met his death in the crash on the 18th August, 1945 at Taihoku. Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, however, submitted a dissentient report stating that there had been no plane crash involving Netaji's death as concluded in the Committee's Report.
- 4. The Cabinet considered the Report of the Enquiry Committee signed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan and Shri S.N. Maitra on 9th September, 1956 and accepted the finding that Netaji had, in fact, met his death as a result of the air-crash on 18th August, 1945. The Cabinet also decided that "the question of bringing over Netaji's ashes to India might be left for future consideration."

...2/-

A copy of the Report was laid on the Table of the House by late Prime Minister Nehru on 11th September, 1956 when he informed the House that the Government had accepted the findings of the Committee. The dissentient report too was placed on the Table of the House on 12th December, 1956, and in doing so the Prime Minister again confirmed that the Government had accepted the majority report.

- the spring of 1945 the defeat of the Majority were that about the spring of 1945 the defeat of the Axis Powers became likely, and Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose began thinking of the future activities of himself on the one hand, and of the Indian Independence League and the Indian National Army on the other. As regards himself, he decided to leave South East Asia and to take refuge in Russia, whence, in due course, he could re-emerge and continue the struggle for India's freedom against the British. As regards the Indian Independence League and the Indian National Army, he appeared to be undecided and desired to consult with his allies, the Japanese, before imparting final instructions.
- 6. With a view to implementing these intentions he left Bangkok on the 17th August, 1945, for Saigon, whence he had been promised passages for himself and 6 companions by a Tokyobound Japanese military plane.
- 7. At Saigon, however, there was a serious disappointment: only two passages in an Air Force bomber were offered by the Japanese Military Command, which, as a consequence of Japan's surrender to the Allies on the 15th August, 1945, found itself short of air transport. After some discussion Netaji found himself obliged to accept the 2 passages offered, and with the approval of his companions selected Col. Habibur Rehman to accompany him. Netaji and Col. Rehman accordingly took off for Tokyo by the bomber about 5.00 p.m. on the 17th August, 1945.
- 8. Apart from Netaji and Col. Rehman the bomber included 6 Japanese Service Officers as passengers, and a crew of 5 or 6 persons.
- 9. The bomber landed for the night at Tourane on the Indo-China coast at about 7.30 p.m., and took to the air again with the same inmates at 5.00 a.m. the next morning. The next brief stop was at Taihoku in Formosa in the early afternoon of 18th August, 1945. While taking off from Taihoku later in the afternoon, however, the propeller and the port side engine of the bomber which appears to have been defective even from the start, suddenly dropped out, with the result that the plane immediately crashed about 50 metres off the run-way and burst into flames. Suffering from severe burns Netaji was carried into the Taihoku Military Hospital, where after some hours he passed away.

-3-24-

10. Two days later, on the 20th, his body was cremated in the Taihoku Crematorium. His ashes were collected and temporarily kept in the Nishi (West) Honganji Temple in that city until the 7th September, 1945, when they were flown to Tokyo. There they have since been lying in the Renkoji Temple.

Dissentient Report

- The main burden of Shri Bose's dissentient report is 11. that late Prime Minister Nehru had already made up his mind and had agreed to the enquiry only in response to a pressing demand from a large section of the people. Secondly, Shri Bose has charged that two of the members of 3-man Committee were under a "mandate" to arrive at findings which would conform with the pre-conceived notion of the late Prime Minister Nehru that Netaji was dead. He has also charged that he was not taken into confidence by the other two members and was not shown all the relevant material to institute an impartial enquiry. The Committee, he has asked was dominated by the two official members and considered only selective evidence which would only enable them to arrive at the pre-conceived conclusion that Notaji had died in the crash at Taihoku, Shri Bose has gone further to charge that some of the officials of the Government of India had tried to harass and pressurise him into accepting the conclusions of the other two members.
- 12. Shri Bose mainly picked up small contradictions in details relating to the height of the aircraft, timing of the aircrash, etc. He also maintained that there was evidence contradicting that there was any aircrash at all. This dissentient report was carefully examined by the Government and when laying the report on the table of the House on 12,12,1956, Prime Minister Nehru said that Government adhered to their acceptance of the majority report.

Continuing 13.
rumours and Report Report find survival fres

There have been repeated demands for undertaking another enquiry ever since the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee Report was published. However, Government having accepted the findings of the Committee, have taken the position that unless fresh evidence or new facts were brought to light a further enquiry was not warranted. Rumours about Netaji's survival and whereabouts, etc., have cropped up repeatedly. these, whenever brought to Government's notice, has been investigated and generally found to be baseless. In 1962, rumour was spread that a Sanyasi of Shaulmari Ashram was in fact Netaji, The Sanyasi, Swami Shradhanand himself denied the rumour. Another claim made by Dr. S.N. Sinha that Netaji was incarcerated in Cell No. 46 of Yakutusk prison in Siberia has not been corroborated by any tangible evidence. Lt. Gen. Fujiwara of Japan who came to India to present Netaji's sword, while urging for further investigation, did not produce any evidence to contradict the findings of the Shah Nawaz Khan Enquiry Committee. Recently a press report in a Bengali Daily, "Jugantar", based on information given by an ex\_Indian army personnel, presently employed in West Bengal -

-4-25-

Police (as Inspector of Police, Security Control, Calcutta), that Netaji left Singapore by submarine towards the end of 1945 was investigated and found to be hearsay and vague information. The latest instance is of the news report claiming that Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose had spoken from Radio Moscow after the Tashkent Agreement, On checking up with Radio Moscow authorities, it was discovered that a student by the name of Subhas Chandra had In fact made the broadcast.

Corresnondence between Prime Minister Nehru and Shri Amiya Bose

14. It has been claimed by Shri Amiya Nath Bose that Prime Minister Nehru, in his letter of April 22, 1964, to him, had accepted that "something should be done to finalize the question of Netaji's death." However, there is nothing to suggest, in the context of the entire correspondence, that at any time Prime Minister Nehru had entertained any doubts about the conclusions the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee Report. Presumably, what Shri Nehru had in mind was that something should be done to persuade those who still doubted this fact to accept the finality of the conclusions that Netaji was no more. Shri Amiya Bose has however claimed that a month before his death, Pandit Nehru had agreed that a proper enquiry Commission should be formed.

Memorandum

On December 26, 1967, about 350 Members of Parliament 15. by 350 M.Ps sent a memorandum to the President demanding a fresh enquiry into the reported death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose, They had urged that further enquiry be made in collaboration with the Governments of Japan and Taiwan. This memorandum was discussed at a Meeting of Secretaries held under the Chairmanship of the Cabinet Secretary on 16th February, 1968 to examine the various points raised. As far as the question of a fresh enquiry was concerned, the meeting was of the view that this was not warranted as no fresh evidence had been brought to light. This recommendation was brought to the Prime Minister's notice in connection with a question in the Lok Sabha on 21.2.1968. The Prime Minister, in reply to the question, stated that "since no new facts have been brought to light, Government do not consider that any fresh enquiry is warrented.

Recent requests Enquiry

Shri Samar Guha wrote in May this year to the Prime 16. Minister requesting for a judicial enquiry on the analogy of for official the enquiry being conducted in regard to Gandhiji's assassination 20 years after Mahatmaji's death. The Foreign Minister in reply to this letter informed Shri Guha that the terms of reference of the enquiry being conducted into Mahatma Gandhi's assassination did not seek to establish Gandhiji's death. In the letter sent to the Prime Minister by 44 M.P.s, dated August 7, the request for the appointment of a fresh enquiry Commission, consisting of retired Supreme Court Judges and eminent public men, has been made on the ground that a fresh probe was being conducted in regard to the assassination of Mahatma Gandhi and that a judicial enquiry was also being conceded in response to a number of

...5/-

M.Ps' request into the cause of death of the Jan Sangh Leader Shri Dindayal Upadhyay. It is quite obvious that these two examples that have been cited are not on all fours with the demand for an enquiry to establish the death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose.

- 17. The question of inquiry was again raised in the Lok Sabha on Lugust 22, 1969 during the course of interpellation on Starred Question No.8 Shri S.M. Banerji wanted to know why the Government could not appoint another Commission to inquire into the whole thing. The Home Minister replied "This matter is under the active consideration of the Government. The Prime Minister has recently received certain memorandum from Members of Parliament and we are very actively considering this."
- 18. It is for consideration whether a Commission of Inquiry should be appointed. In case it is decided that such a Commission should be appointed, the mover of the resolution may be requested to withdraw the resolution on an assurance that Government will shortly appoint a Commission of Inquiry consisting of a single Judge of the Supreme Court, Minister of Home Affairs and Minister of External Affairs have seen this note.

SECHET D.O. NO. 10/21/489 - 27-

P.P. Caprihan, Deputy Secretary.

August 29, 1969.

My dear Arora,

Prime Minister has desired that the note prepared by the Ministry of Home Affairs on the "Disappearance of Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945" in connection with a Private Member's Resolution in the Lok Sabha may be brought before the Cabinet for consideration. You would recollect that this mote was forwarded to the Department of Parliamentary Affairs for placing before the Cabinet Committee on Parliamentary Affairs for its consideration. It is requested that 45 copies of the note, with suitable formal amendments, may kindly be sent to Cabinet Secretariat so that it may be circulated to Members of the Cabinet before the next meeting. This may kindly be treated as 'urgent'.

Yours sincerely.

Sd/-

(P.P. Caprihan)

Shri G.K. Arora. Deputy Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs.

Mari P.P. Caprinan,

Work Delhi

Copy to Shri H.N. Trivedi, Secretary, Department of Parliamentary Affairs.

> (P.P. Caprihan) Deputy Secretary to the Cabinet.

18.00 18.00

J. No. SCRET/IMMEDIATE

No. 32/132/69-Poll.1(A) Government of India Ministry of Home Affairs

> 1st September New Delhi-1, the 31th August, 1969.

OFFICE MEMORANDUM Subject:-Disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945.

> The undersigned is directed to send herewith \$5 copies of the Note for the Cabinet on the subject mentioned above, for the consideration of the Cabinet.

> > Goli h. Ar

(G.K. ARORA) Deputy Secretary to the Government of India.

To

Shri P.P. Caprihan, Deputy Secretary, Cabinet Secretariat, New Delhi.

besits and articles about Wataji Subban Changen Biss and studied relevant disserted records pertaining to the

The majors openered and diennissed th to of the witnesses whom they had parsonally

interviewed and took into consideration the evidence

from several scoress. The borne sembors of the

Constitute them arrived at cortain stond continuings and

SECRET

## MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

## Note for the Cabinet

Subject:- Disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945.

In April 1956, in response to the public demand, Government of India appointed an Enquiry Committee to ascertain the circumstances concerning Netaji's departure from Bangkok on 16.8.1945 and his alleged death in an air-crash. The Committee consisted of the following:-

- (i) Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, M.P., Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister of Railways and Transport;
- (11) Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, elder brother of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose; and
- (iii) Shri S.N. Maitra, I.C.S., formerly Chief Commissioner, Andamans and Nicobar.

The Committee examined witnesses in Delhi, Calcutta,
Bangkok, Saigon, Tourane and Tokyo. They also examined
books and articles about Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose and
studied relevant classified records pertaining to the
matter.

ments of the witnesses whom they had personally interviewed and took into consideration the evidence from several sources. The three members of the Committee then arrived at certain broad conclusions and

- 2 -

unanimously agreed that the report should be written on the basis of these conclusions. These were summarised in a list entitled "Principal points agreed to for Draft Report dated 30.6.1956". This was signed by all the three members of the Committee on 2.7.1956.

- 3. Shri Suresh Chandra Bose had agreed with the principal conclusions and signed the documents containing these on 2.7.1956. The conclusions confirmed that Netaji had, in fact, met his death in the crash on the 18th August, 1945 at Taihoku. Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, however, submitted a dissentient report stating that there had been no plane crash involving Netaji's death as concluded in the Committee's Report.
- Enquiry Committee signed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan and Shri S.N. Maitra on 9th September, 1956 and accepted the finding that Netaji had, in fact, met his death as a result of the air-crash on 18th August, 1945. The Cabinet also decided that "the question of bringing over Netaji's ashes to India might be left for future consideration". A copy of the Report was laid on the Table of the House by late Prime Minister Nebru on 11th September, 1956 when he informed the House that the Government had accepted the findings of the Committee. The dissentient report too was placed on the Table of the House on 12th December, 1956, and in doing so the Prime Minister again confirmed that the Government had

2-10/cf/56)

-3-31-

accepted the majority report.

- that about the spring of 1945 the defeat of the Axis. Powers became likely, and Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose began thinking of the future activities of himself on the one hand, and of the Indian Independence League and the Indian National Army on the other. As regards himself, he decided to leave South East Asia and to take refuge in Russia, whence, in due course, he could remerge and continue the struggle for India's freedom against the British. As regards the Indian Independence League and the Indian National Army, he appeared to be undecided and desired to consult with his allies, the Japanese, before imparting final instructions.
- 6. With a view to implementing these intentions he left Bangkok on the 17th August, 1945, for Saigon, whence he had been promised passages for himself and 6 companions by a Tokyo-bound Japanese military plane.
- appointment: only two passages in an Air Force bomber were offered by the Japanese Military Command, which, as a consequence of Japan's surrender to the Allies on the 15th August, 1945, found itself short of air transport. After some discussion Netaji found himself obliged to accept the 2 passages offered, and with the approval of his companions selected Col. Habibur Rehman to accompany him. Netaji and Col. Rehman accordingly took off for

-32

Tokyo by the bomber about 5.00 p.m. on the 17th August, 1945.

- Apart from Netaji and Col. Rehman the bomber included 6 Japanese Service Officers as passengers, and a crew of 5 or 6 persons.
- 9. The bomber landed for the night at Tourane on the Indo-China coast at about 7.30 p.m., and took to the air again with the same inmates at 5.00 a.m. the next morning. The next brief stop was at Taihoku in Formosa in the early afternoon of 18th August, 1945. While taking off from Taihoku later in the afternoon, however, the propeller and the port side engine of the bomber which appears to have been defective even from the start, suddenly dropped out, with the result that the plane immediately crashed about 50 metres off the run-way and burst into flames. Suffering from severe burns Netaji was carried into the Taihoku Military Hospital, where after some hours he passed away.
- Two days later, on the 20th, his body was cremated in the Taihoku Crematorium. His ashes were collected and temporarily kept in the Nishi (West) Honganji Temple in that city until the 7th September, 1945, when they were flown to Tokyo. There they have since been lying in the Renkoji Temple.

Dissentient Report 11. The main burden of Shri Bose's dissentient report is that late Prime Minister Nehru had already made up his mind and had agreed to the enquiry only in

-33-

response to a pressing demand from a large section of the people. Secondly, Shri Bose has charged that two of the members of 3-man Committee were under a "mandate" to arrive at findings which would conform with the preconceived notion of the late Prime Minister Nehru that Netaji was dead. He has also charged that he was not taken into confidence by the other two members and was not shown all the relevant material to institute an impartial enquiry. The Committee, he has asked was dominated by the two official members and considered only selective evidence which would only enable them to arrive at the pre-conceived conclusion that Netaji had died in the crash at Taihoku. Shri Bose has gone further to charge that some of the officials of the Government of India had tried to harass and pressurise him into accepting the conclusions of the other two members.

12. Shri Bose mainly picked up small contradictions in details relating to the height of the aircraft, timing of the aircrash, etc. He also maintained that there was evidence contradicting that there was any aircrash at all. This dissentient report was carefully examined by the Government and when laying the report on the table of the House on 12.12.1956, Prime Minister Nehru said that Government adhered to their acceptance of the majority report.

Continuing
rumors about
Netaji's
survival

13. There have been repeated demands for undertaking another enquiry ever since the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee Report was published. However, Government

having accepted the findings of the Committee, have taken the position that unless fresh evidence or new facts were brought to light a further enquiry was not warranted. Rumours about Netaji's survival and whereabouts, etc., have cropped up repeatedly. Each of these, whenever brought to Government's notice, has been investigated and generally found to be baseless. In 1962, rumour was spread that a Sanyasi of Shaulmari Ashram was in fact Netaji. The Sanyasi, Swami Shradhanand himself denied the rumour. Another claim made by Dr. S.N. Sinha that Netaji was incarcerated in Cell No. 46 of Yakutusk prison in Siberia has not been corroborated by any tangible evidence. Lt. Gen. Fujiwara of Japan who came to India to present Netaji's sword, while urging for further investigation, did not produce any evidence to contradict the findings of the Shah Nawaz Khan Enquiry Committee. Recently a press report in a Bengali Daily, "Jugantar", based on information given by an ex-Indian army personnel, presently employed in West Bengal Police (as Inspector of Police, Security Control, Calcutta), that Wetaji left Singapore by submarine towards the end of 1945 was investigated and found to be hearsay and vague information. The latest instance is of the news report claiming that Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose had spoken from Radio Moscow after the Tashkent Agreement. On checking up with Radio Moscow authorities, it was discovered that a student by

-35

the name of Subhas Chandra had in fact made the broadcast.

Correspondence between Prime Minister Nehru and Shri Amiya Bose that Prime Minister Nehru, in his letter of April 22, 1964, to him, had accepted that "somethin; should be done to finalize the question of Netaji's death".

However, there is nothin; to suggest, in the context of the entire correspondence, that at any time Prime Minister Nehru had entertained any doubts about the of conclusions/the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee Report.

Presumably, what Shri Nehru had in mind was that something should be done to persuade those who still doubted this fact to accept the finality of the conclusions that Netaji was no more. Shri Amiya Bose has however claimed that a month before his death, Pandit Nehru had agreed that a proper enquiry Commission should be formed.

Memorandum by 350 M.Ps. Parliament sent a memorandum to the President demanding a fresh enquiry into the reported death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. They had urged that further enquiry be made in collaboration with the Governments of Japan and Taiwan. This memorandum was discussed at a Meeting of Secretaries held under the Chairmanship of the Cabinet Secretary on 16th February, 1968 to examine the various points raised. As far as the question of a fresh enquiry was concerned, the meeting

1 1-4

-836"

was of the view that this was not warranted as no fresh evidence had been brought to light. This recommendation was brought to the Prime Minister's notice in connection with a question in the Lok Sabha on 21.2.1968. The Prime Minister, in reply to the question, stated that "since no new facts have been brought to light, Government do not consider that any fresh enquiry is warranted.

Recent requests for official Enquiry

Shri Samar Guha wrote in May this year to the Prime Minister requesting for a judicial enquiry on the analogy of the enquiry being conducted in regard to Gandhiji's assassination 20 years after Mahatmaji's death. The Foreign Minister in reply to this letter informed Shri Guha that the terms of reference of the enquiry being conducted into Mahatma Gandhi's assassination did not seek to establish Gandhiji's death. In the letter sent to the Prime Minister by 44 M.Ps., dated August 7, the request for the appointment of a fresh enquiry Commission, consisting of retired Supreme Court Judges and eminent public men, has been made on the ground that a fresh probe was being conducted in regard to the assassination of Mahatma Gandhi and that a judicial enquiry was also being conceded in response to a number of M.Ps' request into the cause of death of the Jan Sangh Leader Shri Dindayal Upadhyay. It is quite obvious that these two examples that have been cited are not on all fours with the demand for an enquiry to establish the death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose.

The question of inquiry was again raised in the Lok Sabha on August 22, 1969 during the course of interpellation on Starred Question No.8 Shri S.M.

Banerji wanted to know why the Government could not appoint another Commission to inquire into the whole thing. The Home Minister replied "This matter is under the active consideration of the Government. The Prime Minister has recently received certain memorandum from Members of Parliament and we are very actively considering this."

18. It is for consideration whether a Commission of Inquiry should be appointed. In case it is decided that such a Commission should be appointed, it may consist of a single Judge of the Supreme Court.

Minister of Home Affairs and Minister of External Affairs have seen this note.

( L. P. Singh)
Secretary to the Govt. of India

/\_32/132/69\_Poll,I(A)/

NEW DEIHI\_1.

The 1st September, 1969.

Cabinet Secretariat

IMMEDIATE 38-

Mo.10/21/CF-69
GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
CABINET SECRETARIAT
(Department of Cabinet Affairs)

New Delhi, the 2nd September, 1969.
11th Bhadra, 1891 S.E.

Subject: Disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose in 1945.

Reference Ministry of Home Affairs Meme. No.32/
132/69-Poll.I(A) dated 1st September 1969, forwarding,
45 copies of a Note for the Cabinet on the above subject.

2. It is requested that draft Press Brief in respect of this item may be prepared and sent to us urgently unless the Ministry are of the view that the decision of the Cabinet in this case should not be released to the press; in that case the reasons for such a view may be intimated.

(R.N. Kalia)
Under Secretary to the Cabinet.

To

The Ministry of Home Affairs, (Shri G.K. Arora, Deputy Secretary).

Orgalor

IMMEDIATE 39

COPY NO. 36

Nb.39/CM/69 GOVERNMENT OF INDIA CABINET SECRETARIAT

(Department of Cabinet Affairs)

New Delhi, the <u>2nd September 1969</u>. 11 th Bhadra 1891.

A meeting of the Cabinet will be held at 10-00 A.M. on Friday, September 5, 1969, in the Conference Room

(No.155 - First Floor), Ministry of External Affairs,
South Block.

## AGENDA

- 1. Cultural Agreement between India and the Philippines. (Paper dt. 30-8-69, attached).
- Education & Youth Services).

  (Minister of Labour and Rehabilitation).

(Minister of

- 2. Court deposits, deposits of minors and others under the guardianship of courts deposits of wards under the court of wards and under the control of Managers, Encumbered Estates.

  (Paper dt. 22-8-69, attached).
- (Minister of Home Affairs).

3. Disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945. (Paper dt. 1-9-69, attached).

(R.N. Kalia)
for Cabinet Secretary.

To

All Members of the Cabinet.

Copy, with a copy of the enclosures, forwarded to the Secretary to the Prime Minister/the Joint Secretary to the Prime Minister/the Erryate Secretary to the Prime Minister.

SECRET

P. T. O.

Copy, with a copy of the enclosures, forwarded to the Secretary to the President/the Secretary to the Vice-President, for information.

(R.N. Kalia)
Under Secretary to the Cabinet.

Invitation to attend the meeting in respect of Item No.1 has been separately sent to the Minister of State in the Ministry of Education and Youth Services.

Intimation about the meeting in respect of items shown against each has been separately sent to:

Secretary, Ministry of Education & Youth Services.

Secretary (EA II), Ministry of External Affairs (Shri V.H. Coelho).

Secretary, Department of Rehabilitation.

Finance Secretary.

Secretary (Expenditure), Ministry of Finance.

Secretary (EA I), Ministry of
External Affairs
(Shri Kewal Singh)

Secretary, Ministry of Rome Affairs.

Foreign Secretary, Ministry of
External Affairs
(Shri T.N. Kaul).

(Item 1).

(Item 2).

(Item 3).

SECRET

'Gulati'
40 copies

## SECRET LN6.10

No.39/CM/69
GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
CABINET SECRETARIAT
(Department of Cabinet Affairs)

New Delhi, the <a href="2nd September 1969">2nd September 1969</a>.

11th Bhadra 1891.

The undersigned is directed to state that a meeting of the Cabinet will be held at 10-00 A.M. on Friday,

September 5, 1969, in the Conference Room (No.155 - First Floor), Ministry of External Affairs, South Block, to discuss inter alia the following:-

SUBJECT

Disappearance of Notaji Subbas Chandra Bose in 1945. (Paper dt. 1-9-69, attached). (Minister of Heme

This is item 3 on the sgends.

(R.N. Kalia) Under Secretary to the Cabinet,

Shri T.N. Kaul.

S.No.11 HOST IMMEDIATE/SECRET

No. 32/132/69-Pol. I(A) GOVERNMENT OF INDIA MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

New Delhi -1, the 3rd September, 191

5802 5.9.4

Subject: - Disappearance of Neta i Subhas Chandra Bose in 194

The undersigned is directed to refer to Cabinet Secretariat O.M. No. 10/21/CF-69 dated the 2nd September 1969 and to forward herewith a draft brief for the press. It may be considered for release only in case Government were to decide in favour of a Commission. If the Government think that a fresh inquiry is not warranted, an alternative brief for the Press is enclosed.

(G.K. Arora) Deputy Secretary to the Govt. of India Tele No. 373606.

To

The Cabinet Secretariat, (Shri R.N. Kalia, Under Secretary) NEW DETHI

Califur Seelt

May be apoproved with the omission snown in practect o

N.t. San 5

Stem 3

## DRAFT PRESS BRIEF

In April 1956 Government of India had appointed an Enquiry Committee consisting of Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, M.P., Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, elder brother of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose and Shri S.N. Maitra, I.C.S., to ascertain the circumstances concerning Netaji's departure from Bangkok on 16.8.1945 and his alleged death in an air crash. The Enquiry Committee came to the conclusion that Netaji had, in fact, met his death as a result of the air crash on 18th August 1945. Shri Suresh Chandra Bose however submitted a dissentient report stating that there had been no plane crash involving Netaji's death as concluded in the Committee's Report. The Government had accepted the majority report.

2. However, there have been repeated demands from MPs I for a fresh enquiry into the reported death of Netaji. The matter was also raised in Parliament. The Government have considered the matter thoroughly and have decided to appoint a Commission of Inquiry under the Commissions of Inquiry Act 1952 to go into the matter. The Commission of Inquiry would consist of a single Judge of the Supreme Court.

# ALTERNATIVE BRIDE

In April 1956 Government of India had appoint ed an Enquiry Committee consisting of Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, M.P., Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, elder brother of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose and Shri S.N. Maitra, I.C.S., to ascertain the circumstances concerning Netaji's departure from Bangkok on 16.8.1945 and his alleged death in an air crash. The Enquiry Committee came to the conclusion that Netaji had, in fact, met his death as a result of the air crash on 18th August 1945. Shri Suresh Chandra Bose however submitted a dissentient report stating that there had been no plane crash involving Netaji's death as concluded in the Committee's Report. The Government had accepted the majority report.

However, there have been repeated demands from MPs for a fresh enquiry into the reported death of Netaji. The matter was also raised in Parliament. The Government have considered the matter carefully and have come to the conclusion that a fresh enquiry into the matter is not warranted, called for.

SECRET

IMM EDI ATE

COPY NO.

No.39/CM/69
GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
CABINET SECRETARIAT
(Department of Cabinet Affairs)

New Delhi, the 6th September, 1969.

The undersigned is directed to enclose a copy

of the minutes of the meeting of the Cabinet held

on September 5, 1969 (Cases Nos.203/39/69 to 205/39/69).

(R.N. Kalia)
for Cabinet Secretary.

To

All Members of the Cabinet.

Copy, with a copy of the enclosures, and the relevant papers, forwarded to the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs and Shipping & Transport/the Minister of Irrigation & Power, for information.

Copy, with a copy of the enclosures, forwarded to the Secretary to the Prime Minister/the Joint Secretary to the Prime Minister.

Copy, with a copy of the enclosures, forwarded to the Secretary to the President/the Secretary to the Vice-President, for information.

(R.N. Kalia)
Under Secretary to the Cabinet.

Copy of the minutes in respect of the cases shown against each forwarded to:-

Shri Bhakt Darshan, Minister of State I in the Ministry of Education & I (Case No.203/39/69)
Youth Services.

Under Secretary to the Cabinet.

P.T.O.

SECRET

01 Y400

Copy of the minutes in respect of Cases shown against each also forwarded to:-

> Secretary, Ministry of Education & X Youth Services. Secretary (EA II), Ministry of External Affairs (Shri V.H. Coelho).

X (Case No.203/39/69).

Secretary, Department of Rehabilitation.

Finance Secretary. Secretary (Expenditure), Ministry

of Finance.
Secretary(EA I), Ministry of
External Affairs

(Shri Kewal Singh). Special Secretary, Department of Economic Affairs. (Case No.204/39/69).

Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs I Foreign Secretary, Ministry of I (Case No.205/39/69). External Affairs (Shri T.N. Kaul).

(R.M. Kalia) Under Secretary to the Cabinet.

"KAPOOR\* 50 copies.

The relation to the state of th

b)

## MEETING OF THE CABINET HELD AT 10-00 A.M.

## PRESENT

Shrimati Indira Gandhi, Prime Minister. Shri Fakhruddin Ali Ahmed, Minister of Industrial Development, Internal Trade and Company Affairs. Shri Bali Ram Bhagat, Minister of Foreign Trade and Supply.

Shri Y.B. Chavan, Minister of Home Affairs. Shri Jai Sukh Lal Hathi, Minister of Labour and Rehabilitation.

Shri Jagjivan Ram, Minister of Food and Agriculture. Shri P. Govinda Menon, Minister of Law and Social Welfare.

Shri C.M. Poonacha, Minister of Steel & Heavy Engineering.

Shri Dinesh Singh, Minister of External Affairs.
Dr. Karan Singh, Minister of Tourism and Civil Aviation.
Dr. Ram Subhag Singh, Minister of Railways.
Sardar Swaran Singh, Minister of Defence. Shri Satya Narayan Sinha, Minister of Information & Broadcasting, and Communications.

### ALSO PRESENT

Shri Bhakt Darshan, Minister of State in the Ministry of Education & Youth Services (Item 1).

#### IN ATTENDANCE

Shri V. Nanjappa, Secretary, Department of Rehabilitation (Item 2).

Shri L.P. Singh, Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs (Item 3).

Shri T.P. Singh, Finance Secretary (Item 2). Shri T.N. Kaul, Foreign Secretary (Item 3).

Shri P.N. Haksar, Secretary to the Prime Minister. Shri V.H. Coelho, Secretary (EA II), Ministry of

External Affairs (Item 1).

Shri Kewal Singh, Secretary (EA I), Ministry of External Affairs (Item 2).

Dr. I.G. Patel, Special Secretary, Department of Economic Affairs (Item 2).

Shri A.B. Chandiramani, Joint Educational Adviser, Ministry of Education & Youth Services (Item 1). Shri A.P.V. Krishnan, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Finance (Deptt. of Expenditure) (Item 2).

## SECRETARIAT

Shri B. Sivaraman. Shri J.S. Mongia:

....2/-

Case No. 205/39/69.

Item 3.

## Disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945.

The Cabinet considered the note dated September 1, 1969 from Ministry of Home Affairs.

- 2. On the question as to whether an inquiry was at all necessary, one view was that as no new evidence had come to light and a Commission of Inquiry would have no legal authority to function outside the borders of the country, little purpose would be served by setting up yet another Commission of Inquiry. It was appreciated, however, that as a number of Members of Parliament were insistent that a further probe into the cause of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose's death was necessary, it would not be possible to withstand the pressure. In this context, three possible alternatives, for satisfying the demand, were considered:
  - (i) An eminent scholar may be asked to undertake an historical research into the circumstances leading to the disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose.
  - (ii) A retired judge may be asked to sift all available evidence with a view to advising whether a prima facie case existed for a further probe.
  - (iii) A Committee of three prominent persons may be requested to go into the question, both within the country and outside.

.....3/-

Taking the political and other aspects of the problem into account, it was ultimately agreed that none of the alternatives may be suitable at present, It was decided that no enquiry will be made now. If there is a consistent demand from a large section of the Members of Parliament the matter can be brought up later.

\*KATARIA\*
10 copies.

SECRET

1.N. 13 D.O. No. 10/21/CF-68 Parliament Bause. Name The Printer August 7, 1960. lote the cause of tragin death Parlicent to sol up a Fresh angular Gonaleston, consisting of retired Supreme Sourt/and eminent publicates, to make fresh proba into the circumstances leading to disappearance We derivently hope that the desind for a fresh enough (J.S. Mongia) Youry sincepely. Ballin 1, 11, 0, General 2) D.K. Karty 3. Should Brushan 4. A.L. Change Di Aska Sen S. M. N. Tempel

J.S. Mongia, Joint Secretary to the Cabinet.

> Mondary of Marligaent (Lot Saths)

> > September 11, 1969.

Prine Minister of India. My dear Srinivasavaradan,

instit

Sort. Indire Gambi.

Please refer to Cabinet Secretariat Memo No. 39/ CM/69 dated the 6th September, 1969, forwarding a copy of the minutes of the Cabinet meeting held on September 5, 1969 relating to the item "Disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945". While approving the draft minutes, P.M. has minuted as under:

"After much discussion, as far as I remember, the final decision was not to go further with the enquiry. My personal view is that we might explain the position to the M.Ps who have signed. I doubt if many will support Shri Samar Guha once the position is made clear to them. However, if there is a consistent demand, we may consider having the matter informally examined by a competent and impartial person."

A copy of the representation submitted by Members of Parliament to the Prime Minister on this subject is enclosed. You may kindly arrange to take further action as appropriate.

Yours sincerely,

Shri T.C.A. Srinivasavaradan. Joint Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs, NEW DELHI

13. Karni Singh le: R.P. Mandel 15. P. Venkatesubbleh 16. Madhu Linaye

17. Rabi Ray 18. Bui Raj Radhok, MEMBER OF PARLIAMENT (Lek Sabha)

Parliament House. New Delhi-1. August 7. 1969.

Members of Parliament (Lok Sabha)

Smt. Indira Gandhi. Prime Minister of India. New Delhi.

Dear Madam.

You will, we hope remember that over 350 members of Parliament made an earnest appeal to the Government to institute a fresh enquiry into the circumstances leading to disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose. Nearly 100 other Members of Parliament extended their oral support to the appeal as they were not present in Delhi at the time of submission of the Memorandum to the Government.

After a lapse of 20 years the Government of India very right your considered it desirable to order for a fresh probe into the background of the murder of Mahatma Gandhi.

Recently the Government of India sympathetically agreed to a request made by a number of Parliament Members to institute a judicial enquiry into the cause of tragic death of the Jan Sangh leader, Shri Dindayal Upadhayay.

We trust that in a similar partrictic spirit you will accept the appeal made to the Government by an overthelming majority (nearly two-third majority) of the Members of Parlament to set up a fresh enquiry Commission, consisting of retired Supreme Court and eminent publicmen, to make fresh probe into the circumstances leading to disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.

We fervently hope that the demand for a fresh enquiry about Netaji voiced by millions of our countrymen will not fail to evoke partriotic response from you. Let us not forget that a national duty to fulfil regarding Netaji is overdue.

Jai Hind!

Yours sincerely,

Sd/-

- 7. A.S. Saigal 8. T.S. Jadhave 9. S.N. Dwivedy
- 10. Nath Pai
- 4. V. Sambasivam 12. K. Ambazhagan 18. Bal Raj Madhok.
- 13. Karni Singh 14. B.P. Mandal
- 15. P. Venkatasubbiah
- 16. Madhu Limaye 17. Rabi Ray

- 1. N.G. Ranga
- 2. D.K. Kunte
- 3. Shashi Bhushan
- 4. A.K. Chanda 5. A.K. Sen
- 6. K.N. Tewari

,52

19. A.B. Vajpayee
20. S.M. Joshi
21. N.C. Chatterjee
22. Humayum Kabir
23. Ila Pal Chaudhuri
24. Samar Guha
25. Tenneti Viswanathan
26. Mrityunjay Prasad
27. D.S. Raju
28. Susheela Rahatagi.
29. S.C. Samanta
30. N.K.P. Salve
31. Tridib Chaudhuri
32. Bedabrata Barua
33. Bra Seshiyan.
34. Bakar Ali Mirz
35. G.M. Bakshi
36. M.M. Patel.
37. Sharda Mukerji
38. J.K. Choudhury
39. B.K. Daschowdhury
40. J. Cahanda
41. C.C. Desai.
42. K.L. Gupta
43. P.V. Shastri

as stagmen

onfidential 53

## Prime Minister's Secretariat

Sub: Demand for a fresh Inquiry into the death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose

. . . . .

A copy of the letter dated the 20th September, 1969, from Shri Mulka Govinda Reddy, M.P., to the Prime Minister on the subject noted above is enclosed. We shall be grateful if the Cabinet Secretary would kindly let the Prime Minister have his comments on this letter. He may also like to suggest the lines on which she could consider sending a reply to Shri Reddy.

Joint Secretary to the Prime Minister

Cabinet Secretary / 11-18165

6572

Mulka Govinda Reddy Parliament House Member of Par lament

New Delhi

September 20, 1969

Smt. Indira Gandhi, Pri e Minister of India, New Delhi.

Dear Madam,

You will, I hope, remember that over 350 members of Parliament made an earnest appeal to the government to institute a fresh enquiry into the circumstances leading to disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose, nearly 100 other members of Parliament extended their oral support to the appeal as they were not present in Delhi at the time of submission of the memorandum to the Government.

After a lapse of 20 years the Govt. of India very rightly considered it desirable to order for a fresh probe into the background of the murder of Mahatma Gandhi.

Recently, the Government of India sympathetically agreed to a request made by a number of Parliament members to institute a judicial enquiry into the cause of tragic death of the Jan Sangh leader, Shri Din Dayal Upadhyaya.

We trust that in a similar patriotic spirit you will accept the appeal made to ghe Govt. by an overwhelming majorit (nearly two-third majority) of the MPs to set up a fresh Enquiry Commission, consisting of retired Supreme Court Judge and eminent public men, to make fresh probe into the circumstances leading to disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose.

I fervently hope that the demand for a fresh enquiry about Neta i voiced by millions of our countrymen will not fail to evoke patriotic response from you. Let us forget that a national duty to fulfil regarding Netaji is overdue.

Jai Hind,

Yours sincerely.

Sd/ Mulka Govinda Reddy

-55-

# CABINET SECRETARIAT (Department of Cabinet Affairs)

Subject: - Demand for a fresh Inquiry into the death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose.

1 653/4

q-149

9 1

Reference Prime Minister's Secretariat u.o.No.

PMS-18269 dated the 6th October 1969, on the above subject.

2. While approving the draft minutes of the meeting of the Cabinet held on September 5, PM had minuted as under:-

"After much discussion, as far as I remember, the final decision was not to go further with the enquiry. My personal view is that we might explain the position to the M.Ps. who have signed. I doubt if many will support Shri Samar Guha once the position is made clear to them. However, if there is a consistent demand, we may consider having the matter informally examined by a competent and impartial person."

The above directions of the Prime Minister were brought to the notice of the Ministry of Home Affairs for taking appropriate action in the matter. It is understood that the Home Minister proposes to call a meeting of the 44 Members of Padiament who have signed the representation dated 7th August 1969, to clarify the position. It is being suggested to the Ministry of Home Affairs that they may invite Shri Mulka Govinda Reddy also to the meeting. In view of this, it does not appear necessary to send any reply to Shri Reddy at this stage.

3. Cabinet Secretary has seen.

(J.S. Mongia)
Joint Secretary to the Cabinet.

PM's Secretariat (Shri G. Ramachandran, JS(I) to PM) Cabinet Sectt. u.o.No.10/21/CF-69, dated 17-10-69.

D.O.No.10/21/CF-69.

Saptombay 10. 10.2

J.S. Mongia, Joint Secretary to the Cabinet. Time Whister of India.

Hew Bellid.

Dany Maddo

Member of Parliament

Nullsa Govinda Babiy

October 17, 1969.

My dear Srinivasavaradan,

pearence of Metalt Subhami Churara Boss, mearly Kindly refer to my d.o. letter No.10/21/CF-69 dated the 11th September 1969, relating to the demand for institution of fresh enquiry into the deappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. I enclose a copy of another representation dated 20th September 1969, received from Shri Mulka Govinda Reddy on the same subject. You may consider inviting Shri Reddy also to the meeting proposed to be called by the Home Minister, to clarify the position to the signatories of the memorandum dated 7th August, 1969. sugal by Into

20016

2. Action taken in this connection may kindly be intimated to us for the information of the Prime Minister.

accept the apost made to the Covt. by an over-meining wejerft

Yours sincerely, dirougstances leading to disappearance of

Tongs sincopely.

sa/- Holles Govinds, Recor-

JC H (J.S. Mongia)

Shri T.C.A. Srinivasavaradan, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs. New Delhi.

Chandra Bossa

Mulka Govinda Reddy Member of Parliament Parliament House New Delhi

September 20, 1959.

Smt. Indira Gandhi, Prime Minister of India, New Delhi.

Dear Madam,

You will, I hope, remember that over 350 members of Parliament made an earnest appeal to the government to institute a fresh enquiry into the circumstances leading to disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose, nearly 100 other members of Parliament extended their oral support to the appeal as they were not present in Delhi at the time of submission of the memorandum to the Government.

After a lapse of 20 years the Govt. of India very rightly considered it desirable to order for a fresh probe into the background of the murder of Mahatma Gandhi.

Recently, the Government of India sysmpathetically agreed to a request made by a number of Parliament members to institute a judicial enquiry into the cause of tragic death of the Jan Sangh leader, Shri Din Dayal Upadhyaya.

We trust that in a similar patriotic spirit you will accept the apeal made to the Govt. by an overwhelming majority (nearly two-third majority) of the MPs to set up a fresh Enquiry Commission, consisting of retired Supreme Court Judge and eminent public men, to make fresh probe i to the circumstances leading to disappear nce of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose.

I fervently hope that the demand for a fresh enquiry about Netaji voiced by millions of our countrymen will not fail to evoke patriotic response from you. Est us forget that a national duty to fulfil regarding Netaji is overdue.

Jai Hind,

Yours sincerely, Sd/- Mulka Govinda Reddy -58-

Samar Guha MEMBER OF PARLIAMENT (LOK SABHA)

PARLIAMENT HOUSE NEW DERHI -1. August ?, 1969.

Smt. Indira Gandhi, Prime Minister of India. NEW DLEHI.

Dear Madam.

You will, We hope, remember that over 350 Members of Parliament made an earnest appeal to the Government to institute a fresh endury into the circumstances leading to disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. Neally 100 other Members of Parliament extended their oral support to the appeal as they were not present in Delhi at the time of submission of the Memorandum to the Government.

After a lapse of 20 years the Government of India very rightly considered it desirable to order for a fresh probe into the background of themurder of Mahatma Gandhi.

Recently the Government of India sympathetically agreed to a request made by a mamber of Parliament Members to institute a judicial enquiry into the cause of tragic death of the Jan Sangh leader, Shri Dindayal Upadyay.

We trust that in a similar patriotic spirit you will accept the appeal made to the Government by an ov runelming majority (nearly two-third majority) of the Members of Parliament to set up a fresh Enquiry Commission, consisting of retired Supreme Court Judges and eminent publichen, to make fresh probe into the circumstances leading to disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose.

We fervently hope that the demand for a fresh enquiry about Netaji voiced by millions of our countrymen will not fail to evoke patriotic response from you. Let us not forget that a National duty to fulfil regarding Netaji is overdue.

Jai Hindi

Yours sincerely,

34/-

N.G. Ranga

D.K. Kunte Shashi Bhushan

A.K. Chanda

A.K. Sen K.N. Tewari 13. 7.

A.S. Saigel 8. T.S. Jadhav

S. . Dedvedy Nath Pai -9.

10.

V. Sambasivam AL.

12. K. Ambazhagan

13. Karni Singh 14.

B.P. Mandal P. Venkatasubhaish 15.

16. Madhu Limaye

-2-59-1

17. Rabi Ray Bal Raj Madhok AS. A.B. Vajpayeo 19. 20. S.M. Joshi N.C. Chatterjee /21. .22 Humayun Kabir 23 Ila Pal Chaudhuri 24 Samar Guha 25. Tenneti Viswanthan 26 Mrityunjay Prasad 27 D.S. Raju 28 Susheela Rohatgi 29 S.C. Samanta 30 N.K.P. Salve /31 Tridib Chaudhuri 82 Bedabrata Barua Era Seshiyan J33. Bakar Ali Mfrza 84 V35 G.M. Bakshi 36 M.M. Patel 37 Sharda Mukerii J33 J.K. Choudhury **-39** B.K. Daschowdhury J. Chanda V40 41. C.C. De sai 42. K.L. Gupta 43. G.G. Swell

. . . .

P.V. Shastri

44

60-

### MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

...

Will you please refer to your J.O.No.PMS 19143 dated 17th October 1969 and also the representation submitted by Members of Parliament to the Prime Minister for institution of fresh inquiry into the circumstances leading to the disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose in 1945? The Home Minister has decided to convene a meeting on 20th November at 9.30AM with a view to discuss the matter with all the Members of Parliament who have expressed themselves in favour of the proposal to have a fresh inquiry. The list of Members of Parliament who have been called for this meeting is enclosed.

(R.Kuppu Rao) Under Secretary

P.M.Secretariat (Shri V.P. Marwaha)
M.H.A.U.O.No.29/48/69-Poll.II. dated 5-11.67

p 50/c

Copy to Cabinet Secretariat with reference to their D.O.No./0/2//CF-68 dated 11th September 1969.

All my

(R. Kuppu Rao)
Under Secy. to the Govt. of India.

Julb 7/11



to increase the man

List of M.Ps. who have been called for a meeting.

Subjects - Dennis for a fresh Angelow Side the

1. Prof. N.G. Ranga, 2. Shri D.K. Kunte.

3. Shri Shashi Bhushan.

4. Shri A.K. Chanda,

5. Shri K.N. Tewari.

6. Shri A.K. Sen.

7. Shri A.S. Saigal.

8. Shri T.S. Jadhav.
9. Shri S.N. Dwivedy.

10. Shri Nath Pai.

11. Shri K. Ambazhagan.

12. Shri Karni Singh
13. Shri B.F. Mandal

14. Shri P. Venkatasubbiah.

15. Shri Madhu Limaye. 16. Shri V. Sambasivam.

17. Shri A.B. Vajpayee.

18. Shri S.M. Joshi.

19. Shri N.C. Chatterjee

20. Shri Bal Raj Madhok.

22. Smt. Ila Pal Chaudhuri.
23. Shri Samar Guha.
24. Shri Tanneti Viswanathan
25. Shri Maitanaidh

25. Shri Mrityunjay Pd. 26. Shri D.S. Raju

27. Shri S.C. Samanta.

28. Smt. Susheela Rohatagi.

29. Shri N.K.P. Salve. 30. Shri Tribid Chaudhuri.

31. Shri Bedabrata Barua

32, Shri Era Seshiyan.

33. Shri Bakar Ali Mirza.
34. Shri G.M. Bakshi

36. Shri N.M. Patel 36. Smt. Sharda Mukerji

37. Shri J.K. Choudhury 38. Shri B.K. Daschowdhury.

Distance of Long Attaches Charles Doors

39. Shmt. J. Chanda.

40. Shri C.C. Desai 41. Shri K.L. Gupta

42. Shri P.V. Shastri.

62

CABINET SECRETARIAT BY SPECIAL (Department of Cabinet Affairs) MESSENGAR

Subject: - Demand for a fresh inquiry into the disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.

ofreuestances leading to the disappearance

1660/0

Reference Ministry of Home Affairs endorsement on their u.o.No.29/48/69-Poll.II, deted 5th November 1969, on the above subject with which a list of 42 MPs invited in the meeting with Home Minister on 20th November, 1969 was attached. On compariston with the original communication it is found that the names of Shri G.G. Swell, MP, and Prof. Humayun Kabir who had also signed the memorandum half been left out. Attention in this connection is invited to Shri J.S. Mongia, Joint Secretary to the Cabinet D.O. letter No.10/21/CF-69, dated 17th October 1969 to Shri T.C.A. Srinivasavaradan, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs with which a copy of the representation received from Shri Mulka Govinda Reddy and a list of 44 MPs who had made a demand for fresh inquiry was sent. It is requested that if the Ministry of Home Affairs see no objection they may invite been Shri Swell and also Shri Reddy to attend the meeting on 20th November. Action taken may kindly be intimated to this Secretariat.

Under Secretary to the Cabinet.

Ministry of Home Affairs (Shri R. Kunnu Rao, Under Secretary)
Cabinet Sectt. u.o.No.10/21/CF-69, dated 13-11-69

188 mg

p56/c

NN6-19

### MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

Subject: Demand for a fresh inquiry to go into the circumstances leading to the disappearance of Netaji.

Will you kindly refer to your u.o. dated 13th November 1969 on the subject noted above?

S/Shri G.G. Swell and Mulka Govinda Reddy have also been invited for the meeting proposed to be held on 20th November 1969.

(R.Kuppu Rao)
Under Secretary

Choinet Secretary(Shri R.N. Kalia, U.S.)
H.A.U.O.No.29/48/69-Poll.II. dated /4/1/4

7.10 21

Dy. Cab 7679

### SECRET/IMMEDIATE

No.29/48/69-Poll.II GOVERNMENT OF INDIA MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

> New Delhi-1 February, 1970.

### OFFICE MEMORANDUM

Subject:- Disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945.

that to around imported may be made graphed age, but if the

1218

The undersigned is directed to send herewith 45 copies of the Note for the Cabinet on the subject mentioned above, for consideration of the Cabinet.

(S.S. VARMA)

DEPUTY SECRETARY TO THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.

To

Shri R.N. Kalia. Under Secretary, Cabinet Secretariat / Depth of Calinet Affaire New Delhi.

h intring South a was nelled for the Mombers of such account

-65-

SECRET

COPY No. 27

MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

### NOTE FOR THE CABINET

Subject: Fresh inquiry into disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945 - Demand for.

The Cabinet in its meeting held on September 5, 1969, considered a note on the disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945, submitted by the Ministry of Home Affairs. It was decided that no fresh inquiry may be undertaken now, but if there is a peristent demand from a section of Members of Farliament, the matter can be brought up later. While approving the draft minutes of the Cabinet proceedings, the Frime Minister had observed that if the position were to be explained to the Members of Farliament who had signed the memorandum demanding a fresh inquiry, it was doubtful whether many would support the demand. The Prime Minister, also observed, "however if there is a consistent demand, we may consider having the matter informally examined by competent and important persons".

- 2. 45 Members of Parliament, who had signed a letter dated 7th August 1959 to the Prime Minister suggesting the appointment of a new commission of inquiry, were requested by the Home Minister to attend a meeting to discuss this matter. Eighteen Members accordingly attended a meeting on 5th December 1969 and views expressed by them are summarised in the attached minutes of the meeting.
- 3. Shri Amiyanath Bose spoke at length explaining why a fresh judicial inquiry was called for. All Members present, except Shri K.N. Tiwari, agreed with Shri Amiyanath Bose that the matter

1/2/w

.../-

required to be inquired into afresh by persons with judicial experience. The Home Minister specifically inquired whether it would not be sufficient if a Judge were to be requested to scrutinise the available evidence and advise whether there was a brima facie case for a further judicial inquiry. The Members present did not agree that this would be sufficient. The Home Minister promised to the Members present that their views would be placed before the Cabinet. The trend of the discussion thus clearly showed that the conclusions of the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee did not find acceptance. The Home Minister, therefore, feels that it would be advisable to appoint a fresh Commission of Inquiry to set at rest any doubts on this sensitive issue. It is for consideration whether in view of the support extended for a demand for a fresh inquiry by Members of Parliament belonging to different political parties, another Commission of Inquiry should be appointed. Minister of Home Affairs and Minister of External Affairs have spen this note.

Secretary to the Government of India

( L.P. SINGH )

(29/48/69 + Poll. II)

NEW DE LHI-1

The 18th February, 1970,

Cabinet Secretariat

Minutes of the meeting held on 5-12-65 at 9.30 A.M. in room No.62, Parliament House.

The Members of Parliament (as per list attached) attended the meeting.

- 2. The Home Minister stated that the memorandum presented by Members of Parliament suggesting a fresh inquiry into the circumstances relating to the disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose was carefully considered by the Cabinet. The difficulty in this matter was that the inquiry by the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee took place about 13 years ago and the Committee had then considered all available evidence. It is doubtful whether, now, after lapse of so much time any fresh evidence would be available on the subject. The Cabinet had, however, decided that the position should be explained to the Members who had presented the memorandum and their views should be ascertained. The Home Minister invited the Members to express their views.
- 3. Shri Amiyanath Bose traced the background leading to the appointment of the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee. Even at that time, he was of the view that a Committee on this subject should be constituted only with persons of high judicial standing who had the experience of going into questions of evidence. Secondly, he also felt that no member of the Bose family should be on the Committee because he would lack objectivity. Regarding the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee itself, he had always taken the view that the Committee was not capable of inquiring into a question of such national importance. Since the publication of the report of the Committee, he had been pressing his demand for an inquiry by Judges of standing. The impression he formed after his conversations with late Pandit

Nohru was that Pandit Nohru had rejected the findings of the Shah Nawas Khan Committee. The Prime Minister had then written to him to state that semething should be done to finalise the question of Notaji's death. Before Pandit Nohru could take any decision in the matter he suddenly passed away.

Regarding the possibility of fresh evidence, Shri Bose made the following points:

- (1) He had been informed that the Government of Japan would still be willing to collaborate and cooperate with any Committee of Judges or any Judicial body that may inquire into the matter.
- (2) According to his information, three intolligence parties went from different directions to Taihoku where the air crash is alloged to have taken place. One party went from Delhi, another party went from the headquarters of Lord Mountabatton and the third was an intelligence party sent Dr. Radha Vinod from G.n. McArthur's headquarters in Tokyo. Pal, who was a member of the International War Crimes Tribunal in Tokyo, had learnt from an American colleague on the Tribunal that the finding of the intelligence party which went from Gen. McArthur's headquarters was that the evidence rogarding the air crash was inconclusive. Secondly, a war correspondent by name Alfred Wagg, who had arrived in Tokyo along with Gon. McArthur, had told Gandhiji in his prosence that the photograph of the damaged air craft which was reported to have crashed in Taihoku airport could not have been taken in Taihoku airport. The location did not tally. It was on the basis of conversations with this war correspondent that Gandhiji had mada a statement that Netaji Boso was alive. Ho admitted that the war correspondent's story cannot now be

- and in its place a modern hotel has been built up.
  - . (3) The explanations regarding the absence of any photograph of the dead body of Subhash Chandra Bose are not convincing.

    The Japanese version was that it was against Japanese custom to photograph a dead body. The explanation given by Shri Habibur-Rahman was that a photograph was not taken because Notaji's face was disfigured due to burns. But when he was asked as to why a photograph of his body was not taken when there were many pursons in India who recognised Netaji's body he had no explanation.
  - (4) Several discrepancies discredit the report of the Committee. The story given out was that Notaji had sustained serious injuries. But at the same time it was stated that Notaji got out of the plane without being assisted by anybody. It was also said that his uniform had caught fire. But he was not wearing any uniform and he had got into civilian clothes in Saigon.
- (5) Shri Habib-ur-Rehman had brought a watch, which according to him, was worm by Netaji at the time of the aircrash. It was given out that it had stopped at the time the aircrash took place. The air crash was reported to have taken place at 2.30 P.M. But the watch had stopped an hour earlier than 2.30 P.M. Further, the watch before it reached Calcutta was open d by experts at the instance of late Mr. Bhulabhai Desai. The watch contained oil ... when it was opened. According to Shri Bhulabhai Desai, the watch which came into contact with so much fire could not contain oil, more so when its leather band was also burnt. He was therefore not willing to accept that the watch was worn by Netaji.
  - (6) Regarding the actual announcement, the Japanese

- (3 . . . . . . . . . . . . .

Government admits, and there is some indication in the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee report also, that some time in July, 1945, Netaji asked the Japanese Government to negotiate on his behalf with the Soviet Ambassador to see whether Netaji with at least 100 men could shift his activities into the Soviet Zone. The Soviet authorities refused to agree. On 6th of August 1945, the first atom bomb fell on Hiroshim and on 7th August the Soviet army started marching into Manchuria. It was only at that stage that the Japanese Government agreed to place a plane at Netaji's disposal and reach him to Dairen. It was further agreed that after he had safely landed at Dairen, the Japanese Government would announce his death. Therefore, the news of the death of Netaji was pre-planned, though the Japanese Government sources also say that the air crash in fact had occurred and, therefore, the announcement about his death was a true announcement. Was a

- (7) According to the Japanese Government, arrangements had been made for Shri Shah Nawaz Khan and others in the Committee to visit Taihoku and the Chinese girl who had attended on Netaji at the time of his death. Shri Shah Nawaz Khan and others did not avail of the opportunity and reasons for their failure to do so are not known.
- (8) It is true that a good deal of evidence had disappeared. But he was quite sure that some of the knowlegeable persons are still alive. If the matter is further delayed, we will of course lose further evidence.
- (9) Sato's evidence, on the basis of which the dissenting report was given by his uncle, will require to be tested.

  According to him, Sato was an anti-aircraft gunner at Taihoku

Pairport. According to him, there was no aircrash. There was only a forced landing by a plane. Suddenly, a military jeep turned up and some people get into the jeep and went away. He (Shri Bose himself) had cross-examined Sate for four hours and his conclusion was that his evidence was utterly useless.

- custody of Government of India which were not placed before the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee. He too had some material which would be placed before the new Commission. There are possibilities of getting people who can give evidence.

  There are people who were involved in this air crash. He, therefore, suggested that it should be treated not so much, but as a question of fresh evidence/as the need for a fresh inquiry into the evidence available.
- 4. Shri S.N. Dwivedi agreed that there was need for a fresh inquiry to remove the doubts about the death of Netaji in the air crash from the minds of the people. But he did not share the views of Shri Bose that members of the Bose family should not be included in the Commission. A more judicial inquiry may not satisfy people.
  - 5. Shri Balraj Madhok said that he had visited places in Burma, Bangkok and Taiwan where Netaji had lived and worked. People of these places expressed doubts whether Netaji was dead. The Government of Taiwan had also no information about the air crash. They were prepared to cooperate fully. Hence an inquiry commission should be appointed and Shri Amiyanath Bose should be included in the Commission.
  - 6. Shri S.M. Joshi supported the view that a fresh inquiry should be made and pointed out that Pandit Jawaharlal Nahru

himself felt the need for finalising the question. According to him, the evidence that was given to the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee was not assessed properly and they took it for granted that the death was a fact.

- 7. Shri Kunta said that the findings of the enquiry Commission are not conclusive and that a frash enquiry should be held.
- 8. Shri B.K. Daschowdhury said that the Shah Nawaz

  Committee's report did not conclusively prove that an air crash
  took place on 18th August and that Netaji was in the plane.

  He supported the appointment of a fresh commission.
- Ommittee did not convince the people. There was no conclusive proof in its report that Netaji is dead. He invited Home Minister's attention to the memorandum which 350 Members of Parliament had submitted to the Prime Minister in this connection. He said that he had visited Burma and Japan and met all the friends of Netaji. But he did not come across any evidence to show that Netaji was really dead. The intelligence report of the American authorities had not also been gone through. Therefore, he suggested that/fresh inquiry should be made by a Judge of the Supreme Court and two or three publicmen in whose integrity the public has full confidence.
- 10. Sarvashri Bakar Ali Mirza, K.L. Gupta, Rabi Ray,
  Tridib Chaudhuri and Era Sazhiyan supported that fresh inquiry
  should be made by persons with judicial experience.
- ll. Shri Mulka Govinda Reddy agreed with the demand that a fresh inquiry should be conducted. He siad that during his

at any that true bus bus placed of blands a designate gratuett, to

Dir

- visit to Kualalampur he had met certain people, none of shom believed that Notaji was dead. He referred to his discussions with Foreign Office persons of Tuipeh. He was told that they had constituted a cell to inquire into the matter and that they firmly believed that Netaji never died in the alleged aircrash. He was also told that they were prepared to cooperate with any commission that the Government of India might constitute to go into the question.
- Commission should be appointed. He also suggested that retired intelligence officers like Shri Mullick should be associated with the commission. He also supported the view that Shri Amiyanath Bose should be included in the Commission.

  13. Shri K.N. Tiwari, however, expressed his disagreement with the views expressed by Shri Amiyanath Bose. He said that since there was no new evidence, there was no need for
  - kept himself hidden.

    14. Shri N.C. Chatterjee expressed the view that there had been no real cross-examination or judicial inquiry. Government should, therefore, agree to a judicial inquiry in order to satisfy people and to remove all doubts.

any fresh inquiry. If Notaji were alive, he would not have

Cabinet the trend of the discussions at the meeting and the views empressed. He further said that an alternative to a formal judicial inquiry would be to request a judge to scrutinise the evidence and advise whether there was a prima facio case for a further inquiry. He wished to know the reactions of the Members. Shri Amiyanath Bose stated that such an alternative procedure would not satisfy the people. Unless the available

evidence has been tested by cross-examination to ascertain truth, it will be impossible for any judge to give any opinion merely on the basis of dead records. What is required is that an eminent judge should examine whatever material is already available, and also have the opportunity to take evidence afresh of persons who may have given evidence before, to find out the truth. A proper commission of inquiry will rouse public sympathy. It should be an inquiry in public.

16. The Home Minister inquired whether a commission of inquiry would be competent to record evidence and cross-examine

inquiry would be competent to record evidence and cross-examine witnesses in foreign courts. Shri Amiyanath Bose stated that according to his information, Japanese Government and people would allow such evidence to be recorded and witnesses to be cross-examined. The Government of Fermosa would also be willing to cooperate.

17. The Home Minister assured the Mumbers that their views would be placed before the Cabinet.

to a mer roll openses provided by a latter the view but to be be try. Gavern

of action of water at later and a second of the order to

of from a filter of faith beathers, a rate of the second of

in a striver of the section of the section of the bearings of the section of the

and outsidered of agent a two down of all bloom granged for albeit

Tell years a their seather a early to do nothing a sive time and their

till to another with word of friends of agriculty brother

with most and add to the sound of energies but on deals

Brother and a left . Lary it that so ton b line rathering

# LIST OF MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT WHO ATTENDED THE MEETING

- 1. Shri Bedabrata Barua
- 2. Shri N.G Chatterjee
- 3. Shri Tridib Chaudhuri
- 4. Shri S.N. Dwivedi
- 5. Shri S.M. Joshi
- 6. Shri D.K. Kunte
- 7. Shri B.K. Daschowdhury
- 8. Shri Samar Guha
- 9. Shri Bal Raj Madhok
- 10. Shri Bakar Ali Mirza
- 11. Shrimati Sharda Mukerji
- 12. Shri Rabi Ray
- 13. Shri Mulka Govinda Reddy
- 14. Shri K.L. Gupta
- 15. Shri Era Sezhiyan
- 16. Shri Shashi Bhushan
- 17. Shri Amiyanath Bose
- 18. Shri K.N. Tewari

SECRET (N-2/

IMMEDIATE COPY NO.

No.14/CM/70 GOVERNMENT OF INDIA CABINET SECRETARIAT (Department of Cabinet Affairs)

> New Delhi, the 3rd March. 1970. 12th Phalguna, 1891.

The agenda for the Cabinet meeting to be held at 6-05 P.M. on Friday, March 6: 1970, in the Cabinet Room (No.9), Parliament House, will be as follows:-

### SUBJECTS

- Cultural Agreement between 1. India and Kuwait. (Paper dt. 20.2.70, attached).
- 2. Code of Conduct for broadcasting on AIR for talks by individuals. (Paper dt.27.2.70, attached).
- 3. Establishment of a textile mill in Malaysia in collaboration with M/s. Birla Spinning & Weaving Mills Co. Ltd., Delhi. (Paper dt.16.2.70, attached).
- Revision in the rates of 4. rovalty on iron ore. (Paper dt.12.2.70, attached).
- Observance of closed holidays 5. on days of important festivals of minority communities.
  (Paper dt.13.2.70, attached).
- Shri Subimal Dutt, ICS(Retired), (Central Vigilance Commissioner -6. Proposal to continue him to hold office beyond the age of 65 years. (Paper dt.24.2.70, attached).
- 7. Upgradation of the posts of Chief Secretaries in Manipur, Tripura, Pondicherry, Andaman & Nicobar Islands. (Paper dt.5.2.70, attached).

(Minister of Education & Youth Services).

(Minister of Information & Broadcasting, and Communications).

(Minister of Foreign Trade).

(Minister of Petroleum and Chemicals, and Mines & Metals).

(Minister of Home Affairs)

impa ( una ptannepa na sa maria da Ma Maria da Maria

-do-

P.T.O.

8.	Revision of pay scale of Private Secretaries to Cabinet Ministers/ Ministers of State - (Paper dt.28.2.70, attached).	( <u>Minister</u>	of Home	Affairs).
9.	Fresh inquiry into disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945 - Demand for. (Paper dt.18.2.70, attached).	( b. 65 66/2	<b>-</b> do-	)
10.	Service conditions of High Court and Supreme Court Judges - Proposals for liberalisation. (Paper dt.25.2.70, attached).		-do-	)
11.	Promotion of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes officers to certain posts of Class I on the basis of seniority subject to the rejection of unfit in order to improve the representation of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in higher grades of Class I posts/services.  (Paper dt.26.2.70, attached).		-do-	)
12.	Proposals for (i) revision of percentages of reservation in services for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, (ii) for utilisation of Vacancies reserved for Scheduled Castes in favour of Scheduled Tribes and vice-versa; and (iii) for increasing the period for carrying forward the reserved vacancies.  (Paper dt.26.2.70, attached).		-do-	
13.	Policy regarding scales of pay for employees of certain Union Territories. (Paper dt.3.3.70, attached).		-do-	, )
14.	Economic and Technical Cooperation with Afghanistan. (Paper dt.3.3.70, attached).	( <u>Minister</u> <u>Affairs</u> )	of Exte	rnel
	for	(R.N. Ka Cabinet S		

To

All Members of the Cabinet.

# SECRET -78

Copy, with a copy of the enclosures, forwarded to the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, and Shipping & Transport, with a request to attend the meeting.

Copy, with a copy of the enclosures, forwarded to the Secretary to the Prime Minister/the Joint Secretary to the Prime Minister/the Private Secretary to the Prime Minister.

Copy, with a copy of the enclosures, forwarded to the Secretary to the President/the Secretary to the Vice-President, for information.

> (R.N. Kalia) Under Secretary to the Cabinet.

Invitations to attend the meeting in respect of items shown against each has been separately sent to:-

Deputy Chairman, Planning Commission. Minister of State in the Ministry (Item 4). of Petroleum and Chemicals, and Mines & Metals Jeganath Rao) (Shri

Minister of Irrigation & Power. (Item 14).

Intimation about the meeting in respect of items shown against each has been separately sent to:-

Secretary, Ministry of Education & Youth Services.

(Items 1 and 14).

Secretary (West), Ministry of External Affairs.

(Item 1).

Secretary, Ministry of Information & Broadcasting.

(Item 2).

Secretary, Department of Legal Affairs (Items 2,10 and 12).

Secretary, Ministry of Foreign Trade (Items 3 and 4).

Secretary (East), Ministry of External Affairs.

(Item 3).

Finance Secretary. Secretary (Expenditure) Ministry c

Finance.

(Items 3,4,7,8,10, 13 and 14).

SECRET

(9kms 4,7,8,10 13 ~ 14)

SECRET

Secretary, Department of (Items 3. 4 and 14). Economic Affairs. (Items 3 and 14). Secretary, Department of Industrial Development. Secretary, Department of Mines & Metals. (Item 4). Secretary, Ministry of Steel & Heavy Engine ring. Secretary, Planning Commission. (Items 5, 9 and 10). Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs. Secretary (Services), Ministry of (Items 6,8,11 and 12). Home Affairs. Special Secretary (UT), Ministry (Items 7 and 13). of Home Afrairs. Foreign Secretary, Ministry of External Affairs. (Items 9 and 14). (Item 12 and 14). Secretary, Ministry of Defence. Secretary, Ministry of Irrigation & Power. (Item 14). Secretary, Department of Agriculture. Secretary, Department of Labour

SECRET

GURNANI\*\*\*\*\*
150 copies.

No. 14/CM/70
GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
CABINET SECRETARIAT
(Department of Cabinet Affairs)

New Delhi, the 3rd March 1970. 12th Phalguna 1891.

The undersigned is directed to state that a meeting of the Cabinet will be held at 6-05 P.M. on Friday, March 6, 1970, in the Cabinet Room (No. 9), Parliament House, to discuss inter-alia the following:-

# SUBJECT

Fresh inquiry into disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945 - Demand for. (Paper dt. 18.2.70, attached).

TAS is item 9 on the agenda.

(Minister of Home Affairs).

(R.N. Kalia)
Under Secretary to the Cabinet.

Shri L.P. Singh. Shri T.N. Kaul.

MOST IMMEDIATE

COPY NO.

No.14/CM/76
COVERNHENT OF INDIA
CABINET SECRETARIAT

(Department of Cabinet Affairs)

New Delhi, the 5th March, 1970. 14th Phalgun, 1891.

Reference Cabinet Secretariat Memoranda of even number dated 3rd and 4th March, 1970.

- The Cabinet meeting scheduled to take place at 6-05 p.m. tomorrow, March 6, 1970, in the Cabinet Room (No. 9), Parliament House, will NOW be held at 10-30 a.m. in the Conference Room (No. 155 First Floor), Ministry of External Affairs.

  South Block.
- 3. The date and agenda of the meeting remain unchanged.

(R.N. Ralia)
for Cabinet Secretary.

To

All Members of the Cabinet.

Commission/the Minister of State in the Ministry of PetroLeum and Chemicals, and Mines & Metals (Shri Jagan th Rao)/the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, and Shipping & Transport/the Minister of Irrigation & Power.

Copy forwarded to the Secret ry to the Prime Minister/ the Joint Secretary to the Prime Minister/the Private Secretary to the Prime Minister.

Copy forwarded to the Secretary to the President/ the Secretary to the Vice-President, for information.

Under Secretary to the Cabinet.

SECRET

P.T.O.

SECRET

Copy forwarded for information to:-

Secretary, Department of Industrial Development.
Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs.
Secretary, Ministry of Education & Youth Services.
Secretary, Ministry of Steel & Heavy Engineering.
Secretary, Ministry of Defence.
Secretary Services), Ministry of Home Affairs.
Secretary, Ministry of Shipping & Transport.
Secretary, Department of Legal Affairs.
Finance Secretary.
Secretary, Planning Commission.
Secretary, Planning Commission.
Secretary, Ministry of Mines & Metals.
Secretary, Ministry of Irrigation & Power.
Foreign Secretary, Ministry of External Affairs.
Secretary, Department of Agriculture.
Secretary, Ministry of Foreign Trade.
Chairman, Railway Board.
Secretary, Department of Health.
Secretary, Ministry of External Affairs.
Secretary, Ministry of Information & Broadcasting.
Secretary, Department of Labour & Employment.
Secretary, Department of Labour & Employment.
Secretary, Ministry of Tourism & Civil Aviation.
Secretary, Department of Economic Affairs.
Secretary, Department of Economic Affairs.
Special Secretary(UT), Ministry of Home Affairs.

(R.N. Kalia)
Under Secretary to the Cabinet.

SECRET

KASHYAP\* 80 copies. SECRET Way

IMM EDIATE

COPY NO

No.14/CM/70 GOVERNMENT OF INDIA CABINET SECRETARIAT (Department of Cabinet Affairs)

New Delhi, the 7th March 1970. 16th Phalguna 1891.

The undersigned is directed to enclose a copy of the minutes of the meeting of the Cabinet held on 6th March, 1970 (Cases Nos. 58/14/70 to 72/14/70).

for Cabinet Secretary

To

All Members of the Cabinet.

Copy, with a copy of the enclosures, and the relevant papers, forwarded to the Minister of Supply, and Minister in the Ministry of Finance/the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, and Shipping & Transport/the Minister of Irrigation & Power, for information.

Copy, with a copy of the enclosures, forwarded to the Secretary to the Prime Minister/the Joint Secretary to the Prime Minister/the Private Secretary to the Prime Minister.

Copy, with a copy of the enclosures, forwarded to the Secretary to the President/the Secretary to the Vice-President, for information.

> (R.N. Kalia) Under Secretary to the Cabinet.

Copy of the minutes in respect of the cases shown against each forwarded to: -

Deputy Chairman, Planning Commission. (Cases Nos.

61/14/70 and

Minister of State in the Ministry of 172/14/70. Petroleum and Chemicals, and Mines

& Metals

(Shri Jaganath Rao).

(R.N. Kalia)

Under Secretary to the Cabinet.

SECRET

....2/-

Copy of the minutes in respect of cases shown against each also forwarded to:-

> Secretary, Department of Industrial Development.

(Cases Nos.60/14/70 and 71/14/70).

Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs.

(Cases Nos.62/14/70. 66/14/70 & 67/14/70).

Secretary, Ministry of Education & Youth Services.

(Cases Nos.58/14/70 and 71/14/70).

Secretary, Ministry of Steel & Heavy Engineering. (Case No.61/14/70).

Secretary, Ministry of Defence.

I (Cases Nos.69/14/70 & 71/14/70).

Secretary (Services), Ministry of Home Affairs.

(Cases Nos.63/14/70, 65/14/70, 68/14/70 and 69/14/70).

Secretary, Ministry of Shipping & Transport. Chairman, Railway Board.

(Case No.72/14/70).

Secretary, Department of Legal Affairs.

(Cases Nos.59/14/70, 63/14/70,67/14/70 and 69/14/70).

Finance Secretary.

(Cases Nos.60/14/70, 61/14/70, 64/14/70, 65/14/70, 67/14/70 70/14/70, 71/14/70 and 72/14/70).

Secretary, Planning Commission. Secretary, Deptt. of Mines & Metals.

(Cases Nos. 61/14/70 and 72/14/70).

Secretary, Ministry of

Irrigation & Power.

Secretary, Deptt. of Agriculture. Secretary, Deptt. of Health.

Secretary, Deptt. of Labour & Employment.

Secretary, Ministry of Tourism & Civil Aviation.

(Case No.71/14/70).

Foreign Secretary, Ministry of (Cases Nos. 66/14/70 and External Affairs.

71/14/70).

Secretary, Ministry of Foreign Trade.

(Cases Nos. 60/14/70, 161/14/70 & 72/14/70). Secretary (East), Ministry of (Case No.60/14/70). External Affairs.

Secretary (West), Ministry of External Affairs.

(Case No.58/14/70).

Secretary, Ministry of Information & Broadcasting. (Case No.59/14/70).

Secretary (Expenditure), Ministry of Finance.

I (Cases Nos.61/14/70, 64/14/70, 65/14/70, 67/14/70, 70/14/70, 71/14/70 and 72/14/70 (Cases Nos.60/14/70, 1 61/14/70, 71/14/70 & 72/14/70).

Secretary, Deptt. of Economic Affairs.

(Cases Nos.64/14/70 & 70/14/70).

Special Secretary (UT), Ministry of Home Affairs.

(R.N. Kalia)

Under Secretary to the Cabinet.

\*KATARIA\* 80 copies.

S\_CREI

MEETING OF THE CABINET HELD AT 10.30 A.M. ON FRIDAY, MARCH 6, 1970.

# PRESENT

Shrimati Indira Gandhi, Prime Minister.

Shri Fakhruddin Ali Ahmed, Minister of Industrial Development,
Internal Trade and Company Affairs.

Shri Bali Ram Bhagat, Minister of Foreign Trade.

Shri Y.B. Chavan, Minister of Home Affairs.

Shri Gulzari Lal Nanda, Minister of Railways.

Shri F. Govinda Menon, Minister of Law and Social Welfare.

Prof. V.K.R.V. Rao, Minister of Education & Youth Services.

Shri D. Sanjivayya, Minister of Labour and Rehabilitation.

Dr. Triguna Sen, Minister of Petroleum and Chemicals, and
Mines & Metals.

Shri K.K. Shah, Minister of Health and Pamily Planning, and
Works, Housing & Urban Development.

Shri Dinesh Singh, Minister of External Affairs.

Dr. Karan Singh, Minister of Tourism & Civil Aviation.

Sardar Swaran Singh, Minister of Defence, and Steel &
Heavy Engineering.

Shri Satya Narayan Sinha, Minister of Information &
Broadcasting, and Communications.

### ALSO PRESENT

Shri K. Raghu Ramaiah, Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, and Shipping & Transport.

Dr. K.L. Rao, Minister of Irrigation & Power.

SECRET

....2/-



#### IN ATTENDANCE

Shri L.P. Singh, Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs. Shri H.C. Sarin, Secretary, Ministry of Defence.

Shri H. Lal, Secretary (Services), Ministry of Home Affairs.

Shri R.S. Gae, Secretary, Department of Legal Affairs. Shri P. Govindan Nair, Finance Secretary. Shri Asok Mitra, Secretary, Planning Commission.

Shri N. Subrahmanyam, Secretary, Department of Mines & Metals.

Shri T. N. Kaul, Foreign Secretary, Ministry of External Affairs.

Shri K.B. Lall, Secretary, Ministry of Foreign Trade.

Shri V. H. Coelho, Secretary (East), Ministry of External

Affairs.

Shri Kewal Singh, Secretary (West), Ministry of External Affairs.

Shri M.K. Dass, Secretary, Ministry of Information &

Broadcasting.
Shri M.R. Yardi, Secretary (Expenditure), Ministry of Finance.

Shri T. Swaminathan, Secretary, Departments of Industrial

Development and Internal Trade. Dr. I.G. Patel, Secretary, Department of Economic Affairs.

Shri M. G. Pimputkar, Special Secretary (UT), Ministry of Home Affairs.

Shri G.K. Chandiramani, Additional Secretary, Ministry of Education & Youth Services.

Shri B. B. Lal, Additional Secretary, Department of Expenditure.

Shri T.N. Lakshminarayanan, Joint Secretary, Department of Mines & Metals.

Shri E. Kolet, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Shipping & Transport.

Shri R: Tirumalai, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Shipping & Transport.

Shri R.D. Sathe, Joint Secretary, Ministry of External Affairs.

Shri G. Ramachandran, Joint Secretary to the Prime Minister. Shri B. N. Tandon, Joint Secretary to the Prime Minister.

Shri R.R. Bahl, Chairman, Minerals & Metals Trading

Corporation (By invitation).

# SECRETAR LAT

Shri B. Sivaraman. Shri J.S. Mongia.

Case No. 66/14/70

3I

Item 9

Fresh inquiry into disappearance of Nataji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945 -Demand for.

The Cabinet considered the Note dated February 18, 1970 from the Ministry of Home Affairs and decided that a Supreme Court or High Court judge may be appointed as a one man Commission of Inquiry.

SECRET

R.G.K. 10 copies.